



إني فاطمة أبا محمد

I AM FATIMA & MY FATHER IS MUHAMMAD

A Short Biography of
Lady Zahra (s)

FAWZI AL-SAIF

2024

I AM **FATIMA & MY FATHER IS MUHAMMAD**

A Short Biography of
Lady Zahra (s)

By: Fawzi al-saif

Translated by: Al-Shiekh Habib Zaatar

Reviewed and Verified by: Ali Lakhani



بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ

Contents



preface..... 9

Az-Zahra Before Birth Until Martyrdom.....11

1. Fatima: Al-Hawra' Al-Insiyya
[The Paradisical Creation in Human Form]: 12

2. Fatima (s) In Her Early Childhood: 15

3. Fatima after her Mother Khadija's Death: 18

4. Al-Zahra's migration to Medina:..... 18

5. Her Heavenly Marriage: 19

6. Was Fatima (s) too young for marriage? 21

7. Fatima's Dower:24

8. The House of Ali (s) and Fatima (s):26

| | |
|---|-----------|
| 9. The Relationship of The Prophet's | |
| Wives with Fatima: | 30 |
| 10. Fatima After the Demise of the Prophet: | 33 |
| "CONCEALING LIKE A FETUS | |
| IN ITS MOTHER'S WOMB" | 43 |
| Doesn't Bravery Stipulate That the Imam (s) | |
| Should Confront the Assault? | 53 |
| az-Zahra's Virtues and The Denial in The Umayyad | |
| School of Thought to Accept Them | 63 |
| Endnotes | 75 |

preface

1. The book in your hands, dear reader, is an abridgement of the biography of one of the fourteen infallibles in Shia Islam. Its pages constitute about 25% of the original book, which also bears the same title. With Allah's Grace and Will, the original book will be translated at a later date.
2. This book, and the other books in the same series, are aimed at the young generation of Shia Muslims who do not have a good command of the Arabic language, in which the original book was written. It therefore assumes a basic knowledge of the concepts related to the Infallible and their life, and seeks to analyze and expand on them.

We note that there are very few translated books in English on the lives of the Imams, especially for young English speakers. This is despite the importance of the topic, and it is one of the reasons that prompted this translation project.

3. Since this book and the rest of the series have been translated by multiple individuals and in different ways, it is natural that they will not all be in a consistent style. We would therefore be grateful if the reader would help us by pointing out any errors or observations they may have, so that they can be corrected in future editions.

I ask Allah Almighty to reward the reader, the author of these pages, and the translators with His recompense and blessings, and the intercession of the Infallibles, may peace and blessing be upon them.

Fawzi Muhammad Taqi Al Saif

Tarut - Qatif

20/09/1445 H

Az-Zahra Before Birth Until Martyrdom

The title is clear, and there is no misprint or misunderstanding! Some people's actual lives and effects begin with their birth, others begin with their puberty, and so on... and then there are those whose lives and blessings begin even before their existence and creation! We believe this is the case with the Messenger of Allāh^[1] and his progeny, including Lady az-Zahrā'.

[1] Translator's note: For readability and for the sake of avoiding multiple cascading parenthesis that would interrupt the flow of the text when read silently or aloud, the decision was made for this translation to omit the honorifics that would normally accompany the blessed names of Allāh's representatives, such as (pbuh), (as), (sawa) and others. We ask the reader to send their blessings and salutations upon the respective personality when encountering their name in the text.

Now whether one accepts this or not is a matter of doctrine, and not a matter of historicity, however, we should note that if someone holds a prestigious position and status, they lose nothing if others are ignorant of their status. Rather, those who lose out are those who are ignorant of that status and are unaware of the prestigious position. There will be an elaboration - God willing - of the reasons that make some people unable to bear these positions and statuses, driving them to make accusations of exaggeration, lies, and fabrication instead of civil discourse.

1. Fatima: Al-Hawra' Al-Insiiyya [The Paradisical Creation in Human Form]:

The Imāmis believe in what is mentioned in the many narrations of the Messenger of Allāh and their Imams. It is enough for us to point to what Sheikh al-Saduq narrated with a reliable chain of transmitters ⁽¹⁾ on the authority of Imam as-Sādiq, on the authority of his father, on the authority of his grandfather, peace be upon them, who said: *"The Messenger of Allah said, 'The light of Fatima was created before the earth and heaven were created.' Some people said, 'O Prophet of Allah, is not she human? He replied, 'Fatima is a paradisical woman in human form.' They then asked, 'O Prophet of Allah, how is she a paradisical woman in human form?' He replied, 'Allah, Exalted and Glorious is He, created her from His light before He created Adam while they were still souls. Then when Allah, Exalted and Glorious is He, had created Adam, she was presented before Adam....'"* ⁽²⁾

Then, as narrated in the sayings of the Ahlul Bayt, when

Allāh, the Almighty, wanted to reveal this light to the world of existence - which was four years and a couple of months after the Prophet's public ministry, or bi'thah, began ⁽³⁾ - He instructed the Prophet to isolate himself from Khadija, fast during the day, and worship during the night. The Prophet remained in that manner until the divine command ordered him to approach his wife, which consequently led to the birth of the doyenne of all women of all time. She was born in the month of Jumada II, 5 years after the beginning of her father's public ministry ⁽⁴⁾.

Here, we would like to address two crucial points, one of which is doctrinal, and the other is ethical:

The Doctrinal point: We are aware that the narrative as portrayed by the Sunni scholars and their literature, indicates that the birth of Lady Fatima was 5 years before the beginning of the Prophet's prophecy ⁽⁵⁾. This will lead to rejecting and invalidating, perhaps intentionally, the narration mentioning Gabriel descending with food from paradise to the Messenger of Allāh. The reason behind this is subtle: Gabriel's descent to the Prophet would make no sense before his prophecy, especially to those who erroneously subscribe to the belief that the Prophet followed the religion of the common 7th century Makkan, as well as to those who believe he became a Prophet at the age of 40, which is not consistent with the Imami view. The Imamis, in contrast, believe the Prophet was born a prophet but remained silent until Allah commissioned him to publicize his message. This would further downplay, not only the paradisaical origin of Fatima (via the food offered to the Prophet by Gabriel⁽⁷⁾) but the status of the progeny of Fatima.

We are shedding light on this alternative narrative, not just

to point out a ten-year gap in history, but to highlight the implications and ramifications it would have on one's belief system: namely Fatima's birth is like any other birth of an ordinary woman, nothing special! However, as we have alluded to, this is not just a conflict of Imami sources and the sources of other schools of thought, this is a verified narration from the Imam about his grandmother.

Of note, there is perhaps a more nefarious objective of some of these scholars which is to prove that when she died, she was about 29 years old ⁽⁸⁾, which is an average age to die. Or at least, not as great of a shock factor if one were to hear the Imami narrative, which is that she died at the age of 18. In other words, the tragic story of her martyrdom and what the Caliphate and their party committed against her would have one more thing to bring doubt into the minds of the people!

The Ethical Point: We start by highlighting what the narrations have taught about halal food's advantages on a good upbringing and acceptance of guidance. Islamic law emphasizes these effects by encouraging the followers to obtain these advantages. Also, eating halal expresses obedience to Allāh.

In contrast, the effect of eating what is haram on the behavior of those who eat it is apparent ⁽⁹⁾. This, of course, is with the acknowledgment that halal and haram consumption is not the absolute [final] reason for people's actions. Thus, no one should say that I know a thief who eats halal while my friend eats what is haram and is an honest, good person. Free will, of course, is not overridden by diet. All we are emphasizing is the overall behavioral and dispositional effects of halal and haram sustenance and the compounding effect it has on the soul.

Therefore, if eating halal food can positively affect one's morals and religion, what if that food was from Paradise? We mentioned earlier the story of the Prophet eating food from Paradise, which formed the body of Fatima, so if Fatima's earthly body was created from the food of Paradise, what would her spirit and soul be like?

Having established this basis, we can understand the narrations available in both sects that the Prophet used to kiss and hug Fatima and smell the fragrance of Paradise from her⁽¹⁰⁾. If she was born five years before the prophecy, what distinguished her in this regard over the rest of the Messenger's daughters or sons? Why did they also not emit a fragrance of Paradise? And if she was not made from the food of Paradise, then from where did this comforting fragrance that the Messenger of Allah come?

Having laid this groundwork, it should not be surprising to read narrations showing Fatima speaking to and giving comfort to her mother, Khadija, while she was in her womb ⁽¹¹⁾.

With these qualities, one understands that the purpose of her existence in this world is different from the rest of the Prophet's daughters, and this will be explained later when we discuss the topic of her status.

2. Fatima (s) In Her Early Childhood:

Fatima would go on to be her mother's companion and joy after she came into this world, just as she was her companion and joy while she was inside her womb. She would be alongside Khadija serving and defending her father however she

could. She would suffer in defending her father, but to her he was more than just her father, he was the Prophet of her time, and comforting him against his enemies' campaign against him was crucial in the upbringing of Fatima, as later she would have to do so with her husband, Ali.

In one such instance, she found herself removing a camel's intestines that the Quraysh placed on the Prophet's shoulder while he was praying. While the Messenger of Allah (p) was performing his prayer near the Ka'ba, Abu Jahl was sitting with his companions and watching. Infuriated that the Prophet would dare pray so openly in view of all the other pilgrims who were the regular customers of the Quraysh, Abu Jahl cried out, "Who will get me the intestines of that she-camel we slaughtered yesterday, and throw it on Muhammad when he goes down in prostration?!" And so one man got up, brought the intestines and, when the Prophet went down in prostration, threw it on his back. The Quraysh laughed at him, and ridiculed him. The Prophet had placed his head in prostration and did not raise it until a man went to his house and informed his daughter Fatima, who was a young girl about this event. When she arrived she started cleaning all the filth from her father's shoulders and head. Then she turned towards these grown men and rebuked them for their intolerant behavior. When the Prophet finished his prayer, he invoked God's imprecations upon them loudly thrice. then he asked for God's blessings thrice. Then he said thrice: 'O Allah, it is for Thee to deal with the Quraysh.' When they heard his voice, laughter vanished, and they feared for themselves hearing his damnation. ⁽¹²⁾.

Although she was young, she witnessed the many conspiracies and assassination attempts against her father and plots to undermine his mission. Therefore, her criticism of Quraysh in her famous sermon of Fadak did not stem from emotion, it was based on her personal eyewitness testimony of their stubbornness to accept the reality of her father's prophethood. While we have not furnished the sermon in its entirety, we encourage the reader to review her powerful sermon and how she spoke about Quraysh, indicating that the Quraysh clans continued conspiring against the prophetic mission.

She did not stand up just to make a point but she instead tried to help her father and alleviate his pain to the extent that a young girl could in the face of cruel and foolish men. On other occasions in her youth, she would find herself clearing the entryway of thorns and needles that had been left to injure the Prophet.

She also suffered, with her parents and the rest of the Muslims, the effects of the Makkan embargo of Banu Hashim in the Valley of Abu Talib. She was patient, as were they all, throughout the ordeal, which lasted over a thousand days. In those long 3 years of suffering, she watched two people defend Islam when it was outcast and weak. Her mother Khadija, and her father's cousin, the young Ali. Khadija's health rapidly declined and her wealth dwindled as she single-handedly financed the Prophet and his followers while accepting weeds and dandelions for herself. She and her mother were of unwavering conviction that Islam was (and is) worth sacrificing everything for if it meant Islam would survive; a point she and her family, especially the younger of her two sons, Imam Hussain, never lost sight of.

3. Fatima after her Mother Khadija's Death:

It is likely that in the period following the death of her mother in the tenth year of the Prophet's public ministry and until the time of her father's migration to Medina, Fatima was living under her great-uncle, Abu Talib's care, who passed away in the same year in which her mother's died. This means she was about five years old at that time and under the care of her uncle's wife, Fatima bint Asad, the mother of Imam Ali. Although the Prophet married Sawdah bint Zam'ah in that year, nothing special can be found in her relationship with Lady Fatima.

This is if what is mentioned in some Sunni sources is that Sawda was among the group migrating to Medina ⁽¹³⁾, is accurate. Otherwise, we do not have much about Sawda in the Meccan era.

4. Al-Zahra's migration to Medina:

Despite the difference between historians of the Sunni and Shia schools ⁽¹⁴⁾ regarding the sequence of the migration and the manner in which they left Mecca, there is a consensus that Lady Zahra migrated after the Messenger of Allah sent someone to bring her to him.

Upon reaching Medina, the Prophet built a house for himself, in which he supposedly housed both his wife, Sawdah bint Zam'ah, who no doubt was a Meccan, along with his daughter Fatima Al-Zahra. Until then, he had not married his other wives, like Aisha. In the narration, the Prophet married her in Shawwal of the same year and then married the rest later.

However, even after reviewing the sources of the two schools, it is yet to be clear to me how the Prophet's wife, Sawdah, interacted with and treated Fatima even though they were supposedly in the same house. In general, little information exists about Sawdah.

5. Her Heavenly Marriage:

Due to the unique virtues she was known for, and because she was the Prophet's (p) daughter, one would think that her marriage would be a matter of great import once she reached a suitable age. Indeed we notice in this case that some were thinking about marrying Fatima as that would give them a unique position in the Prophet's eyes, since during those times - and this continues to be true until today too - marriage was and is an efficient way of solidifying political ties and gaining influence through family relations.

For this and many other reasons, quite a few of the Prophet's companions wanted to marry Fatima, who would have been nine years old at the end of Jumada II of the 2nd year of the Prophet's migration, based on the accepted narration among the Shia of Ahlul Bayt. Let us consult the sources of the two sects:

It has been reported on the authority of Anas bin Malik that he said, "Abu Bakr came to the Prophet, sat in front of him and said, '*O Messenger of Allah, you know my devotion and longevity in Islam, and I...*' The Prophet said, '*What is this about?*' He said, '*Will you allow me to marry Fatima?*' The Prophet responded he would ask Fatima, and she voiced her disapproval.

Then Abu Bakr returned to Umar and told him, *'You have perished and have caused others to perish!'* Umar asked, *'What is the matter?'* He answered, *'I asked the Prophet for Fatima's hand, but he rejected me!'* Umar then said, *'Wait here until I go ask the Prophet what you asked for.'*

So, Umar went to the Prophet, sat in front of him, and said, *'O Messenger of Allah, you know my devotion and longevity in Islam, and I...'* The Prophet said, *'What is this about?'* He said, *'Will you allow me to marry Fatima?'* Again, the Prophet responded he would ask Fatima, and once again she voiced her disapproval.

When Umar returned to Abu Bakr and told him that he was waiting for Allah's command regarding Fatima's marriage, they resolved to go to Ali so they could tell him to put forward the same as what they had requested.

Ali said, *'They came to me while I was gardening they said that they had come to me from my cousin after asking for his daughter's hand.'* He continued, *'They informed me about the matter, so I got up, removed my cloak, and went to the Prophet. I sat in front of him and said, 'O Messenger of God, you know my longevity and devotion in Islam, and I...'* He said, *'What is this about?'* So, I said, *'Will you allow me to marry Fatima?'*

This time, when the Prophet asked Fatima, she remained silent. And the holy Prophet, seeing his daughter's happiness, exclaimed jubilantly *"Her silence is her approval!"*

He said to Ali, *"What do you have for marriage?"* I said, *"My horse and my camel."* He said, *"You cannot give away your horse, but you may sell the camel."* So Ali sold it for four hundred and

eighty dinars, took the money, and put it in the Prophet's lap. He took a handful of it and said, "*Bilal, please buy perfume with this.*" He then instructed other companions to buy pillows and furniture...Until the end of the story ⁽¹⁶⁾.

Some writers from the Sunni school of thought have tried to mitigate the Messenger of Allah's refusal to allow some of his companions to marry his daughter by weakening authentic reports and strengthening weak reports. But what is true is what was narrated on the authority of Imam Ali bin Musa Al-Ridha, on the authority of his father, on the authority of his forefathers, on the authority of Ali that Prophet told him, "*O Ali! Some of the men of the Quraysh tribe have blamed me regarding Fatima's marriage. They said that they asked me to marry off Fatima to them, however, I married her off to you. I told them, 'By Allah, I have not done this of my own self. The Almighty God is the One who did not accept you and married her off to Ali. Gabriel descended upon me and said, O Muhammad! God - the Exalted the Magnificent - says, 'If I had not created Ali, there would be no one who deserves to marry Fatima, from Adam to the end'*" ⁽¹⁷⁾

This marriage was heavenly ⁽¹⁸⁾ before it was earthly, as it has been mentioned in both Shia and Sunni sources that the Prophet said, "*Allah the Almighty commanded me to marry Fatima to Ali.*" ⁽¹⁹⁾

6. Was Fatima (s) too young for marriage?

Historical reports and various narrations ⁽²⁰⁾ state that Imam Ali married Fatima when he was twenty-five and she was just ten years old. Some may object and say it is too early for Fati-

ma to get married when she is only ten years old. This is what prompts some to cling to the reports that state that her birth was five years before the prophecy of the holy Prophet, to remove the hurdle of her being married at such an “early” age, as they claim.

This, however, overlooks two problems:

1. This statement contradicts authentic narrations and documented historical records.
2. More importantly, there is no justification for delaying her age of marriage until she became nineteen years old. Such a delay would have been considered to be quite reprehensible and heinous in Arab culture during that era, given that modern medicine was not available to extend life expectancy, and for the majority of human history, humans did not tend to live past the age of 50 or 60. The proponent of such a delay would then be trapped with one of the following two unacceptable dilemmas: either her marriage was delayed because she was not wanted or desired; or she was wanted, but the Prophet forbade her from marriage.

The problem with the first dilemma is it not only is an insult to the heavenly and pure existence of Fatima, which we have established earlier in this book, but it also directly contradicts the well-attested accounts of many senior companions expressing their interest in marrying Fatima, which can be found in their sources, not just Shia sources.

The problem with the second dilemma is it is widely known that the Prophet would encourage and help many young be-

lievers to get married. Why would he have a different standard for his daughter? One may object by saying nine or ten is still too young, and nineteen can still be considered young, but we would point out that this is a very recent development, that even Western countries would have a very hard time agreeing with if asked at the turn of the 20th century. Once one considers the climate, circumstances, and culture of 7th century Arabia, suddenly, ten years old does not seem to be too young at all.

The reality is what we have mentioned: Ali married her per the divine command revealed to the Messenger of Allah, who rejected everyone else who requested her hand in marriage before him. One should note that even though the Prophet was aware of the perfect match when Ali asked him to marry his daughter, the Prophet set an example for his followers and displayed the honor of Lady Fatima by taking the matter to her.

Here, we bring up an important point:

The issue of age in marriage is a cultural issue, but it is regulated by religion. One of the religious regulations concerning this matter is that it is impermissible to engage in intimacy with a woman before she reaches the legal age, which is the completion of nine years. As for whether this happens when she is ten, fifteen, twenty, or older, it falls within social norms and general physical readiness, which varies from region to region. A twelve-year-old girl in a society in the Arabian Peninsula or Africa often differs physically from her counterpart in Scandinavian countries. The latter may not be prepared for marriage, unlike the first two. This can be seen by the menstrual cycle in many women of the two regions, over there it usually starts at the age of nine, unlike in other areas.

This is not limited to geographical aspects, as even social norms play a role. The situation in our time - for various reasons - is that the marriage of a girl before the age of eighteen is considered "child marriage" and is punishable by law! In previous eras, it was considered an ideal time for a girl to marry, and anyone who delayed beyond the age of eighteen or twenty would be regarded as taboo! It would be considered strange and in need of an excuse!

7. Fatima's Dower:

Various reports indicate that Fatima Al-Zahra's (worldly) dower - since her otherworldly dower ⁽²¹⁾ is beyond comprehension - was about five hundred Dirhams. What has been stated in some reports that her dower was the price of Imam Ali's shield and armor, or that it was "twelve' Uqiyas and one Nash", or four hundred and eighty [Dirhams], or anything else, all goes back to the same mentioned amount. Based on this, we can calculate the dower in two methods:

24

The first method is to calculate and compare the numbers to the equivalent amount nowadays. We start by finding out how much a silver Dirham is worth now. The answer is that since every Dirham weighs two and a half grams, and a gram equals two Riyals (Saudi Riyals according to the value these days), the Dirham is worth five Riyals. Then we multiply five hundred Dirhams by five Riyals, which equals two thousand five hundred Riyals ($500 \text{ [Dirhams]} \times 2.5 \text{ [grams]} \times 2 \text{ [Rials for every gram]} = 2500 \text{ Riyals}$).

Nowadays, and according to the standards of our society,

this amount would be considered very low by many families as the average dowry for women in our society is twenty-five thousand riyals (25,000 Riyals), which is ten times more than the dower of Fatima Al-Zahra (s). In some other areas, dowers rise to one hundred thousand Rials, forty times more. Therefore, this calculation method can be easily used to conclude that Islam encourages lower dowers, as seen in many narrations.^[1]

As for the second method, we would not calculate numbers. Rather, we would compare purchasing value at that time. Cash has a purchasing value – which of course changes with time, whether in an inflationary or deflationary way, along with a large spathe of other variables - determined by what it equals to and what it can buy. We have witnessed in our time that the Dinar, for example, and the Lira have a specific value at a particular time. Then circumstances arise that sometimes affect its value, falling to 1% of its original value and purchasing power. Anyone who doubts this need only ask their elders whether candy was cheaper now or when they were children.

Therefore, based on this method, those five hundred Dir-

[1] Translator's note: It would be confusing if the reader were to convert the currency from Saudi riyals to, say, the US Dollar, since the resulting dollar amount in 2024, would be close to \$6,600, and these figures change with the for-ex markets daily. Rather, simply replace the currency name in the original text for an accurate assessment of the US community's expectations for dowry. Instead of 25,000 riyals, you should expect \$25,000 (US) to be the average dowry, sometimes going as high as \$100,000 (US), as the author notes similar figures in the Saudi community. And of course these, figures will change with differing regions and as times progress, we pray they will see a downward trend, not the same upward trend.

hams should be calculated at their purchasing value. So we ask, with a Dirham or Dinar at that time,^[1] what was its purchasing value? What could a Dinar or Dirham do during the times of the Messenger? What could be purchased with it at that period?

Observing the Zakat book, we find that the narrations reported on the account of the Prophet specify that the price of one sheep was equivalent to ten Dirhams⁽²²⁾. One narration [from a topic other than Zakat] mentions that the Prophet gave a Muslim a Dinar (which is equal to ten Dirhams) to buy one sheep. However, thanks to his intelligence and cleverness, the man bought two sheep with that single Dinar ⁽²³⁾. Regardless, the critical thing to note from this narration is the Prophet's estimation of the price of one sheep, one Dinar, or ten Dirhams.

With this in mind, five hundred Dirhams would be the price of fifty sheep. Suppose we calculate the price of one sheep today and multiply its value by fifty. In that case, this will be equivalent to the dower given to Lady Al-Zahra. Hence, according to the same region we calculated in Riyals, which was 2,500, the amount will change in this second method to be (if we assume that the price of an average sheep is between 500 and 750 Riyals) 25,000 to 37,500 Riyals, or ten thousand dollars.

8. The House of Ali (s) and Fatima (s):

When describing the house of Ali and Fatima, it is sufficient to bring Allah's description in the Qur'ān, where it was referred

[1] Translator's note: Every ten dirhams equal one dinar in the currency of that time.

to that house in the holy verse: *[in houses] which Allāh has ordered to be raised and that His name be praised therein; exalting Him within them in the morning and the evening* ⁽²⁴⁾.

This house, adjacent to the Prophet's house is located within the enclosure of his sacred grave and witnessed many incidents and events worthy of mention. It was the first house to hold an infallible couple in human history, the husband Ali and his wife Fatima, something that did not happen in the history of mankind before or after.

Therefore, that household's rules, etiquette, and practices suit a curriculum that guides the believers. From this, they can learn how to have a happy marital life, which resulted in a relationship that Imam Ali described by saying *"By Allah, I never angered her or forced her to do something (unwillingly) until Allah took her soul. She never made me angry or disobeyed me. When I looked at her face, my griefs and sorrows were relieved."*⁽²⁵⁾

In their household, a basis was laid for each spouse's responsibility. However, this does not mean one does not assist with their responsibility. Instead, it is a fundamental division of duties. In a narration from Imam al-Bāqir, he states, *"Ali and Fatima went to the Messenger of Allah so that he could outline their responsibilities. So, he ordered Fatima to serve inside the house, and he ordered Ali to do the work outside the house."* Imam Al-Bāqir continues, *"Fatima said, 'No one knows the happiness that filled me apart from Allah, that the Messenger of Allah pardoned me from bearing the necks of men.'"* ⁽²⁷⁾

Accordingly, *"Fatima (s) guaranteed Ali (s) the housework;*

she would grind wheat, knead and bake; sweep the floor and Ali (s) guaranteed her (s) the work outside the house; bring water, wood (for the fire), and food.” (28)

This noble house witnessed the revelation of verses and the Prophetic narrations. For instance, the house witnessed the event of the cloak, which is acknowledged across sectarian lines. The context of the narration narrated by her, which begins with her saying, “The Messenger of Allah came to my house one day...” indicates that the matter took place in her house, or at the very least one of the occurrences of this monumental event. The event of the cloak explains the verse of purification and whom it was talking about⁽²⁹⁾. It is one of the most important verses referring to the preferred status of the Ahlul Bayt, as well as their purity and infallibility.

We witness in this house an unmatched occurrence, neither seen in the households of Prophets of old nor anyone else. Namely, the master of creations, Muhammad, used to stand at that house’s door every day for six months (meaning up to 180 times) to repeat for all to hear, that the individuals living there are Ahlul Bayt and that they are purified. Anas bin Malik narrates, “For six months, the Messenger of Allah would pass by the door of Fatimah when going to the Fajr prayer saying: ‘As-Salat, O People of the house [Ahlul Bayt]’ ⁽³⁰⁾! Allah only wishes to keep away filth from you, O People of the house, and to purify you with thorough purification.” ⁽³¹⁾

Not only that, when the doors of the houses that were around and opened to the Prophet’s mosque were closed and blocked as instructed by the Messenger of Allah, the door of this house remained open. Several people became upset by

this instruction and complained about it; the Prophet's relatives were among them. The Prophet told them that the matter was not from him, but rather, it was a divine instruction ⁽³²⁾.

This house is also linked to stories immortalized in the Holy Qur'ān, such as the one in Surah Al-Insān. In this story, Allāh mentions Imam Ali and Fatima feeding the poor, the orphan, and the prisoner; Allāh says: *And they give food despite love for it to the needy, the orphan, and the captive*⁽³³⁾.

This house also witnessed the birth of the extension of the Prophetic successional line, the blessed offspring of the Prophet, both happy and sad occasions that made the Prophet a grandfather.

We believe that the unseen hand of Allāh has clearly intervened in the matter of his lineage and descendants to be limited to Ali and Fatima. Even though he had two sons and four daughters from Khadija ⁽³⁴⁾, Allāh's will was that the males die early and that no offspring came from the other females. Then Allāh's will and wisdom was that no children came from the nine women whom the Prophet married after Khadija, except for Maria, even though he remained with some of them for over nine years. To say the least, this would be seen as peculiar in most marriages. However, it is what the Messenger of Allah said early on, and one of the indications of his prophecy and his knowledge of the future, *"The descendants of every Prophet are from his male descendants, and my descendants are from the descendants of Ali and my daughter Fatima."*⁽³⁵⁾

Lady az-Zahra, gave birth in the third year to her son, al-Hasan, and in the fourth year, al-Hussain, and after them, Zainab

and Umm Kulthum. The fifth of the children was Al-Muhsin ⁽³⁶⁾, who was miscarried during the attack on Fatima's house.

9. The Relationship of The Prophet's Wives with Fatima:

The relationships between Fatima and the Prophet's wives were not all the same, and that is normal and is influenced by multiple factors, including her mother, Khadija's position, jealousy over the Prophet's exceptional love for Fatima, and, most importantly, their political leanings in the matter of succession following the death of the Prophet. It is expected that even if the first two aspects are overlooked, the last element can't be ignored. It is essential to add that narrations and historical facts indicate **"that the wives of the Messenger of God were two parties. One party included Aisha, Hafsa, Safiyya, and Sawdah, and the other party included Umm Salamah and the rest of the wives of the Messenger of Allah."** ⁽³⁷⁾.

30

Narrations indicate that the relationship between Umm Salamah ⁽³⁸⁾ - whom the Messenger married in Shawwal of the year 3 A.H- and Fatima was positive and distinguished. We find that she mentions that the Prophet sent Fatima to her so that she would "discipline and teach her." ⁽³⁹⁾ Only for her to realize that Fatima was more knowledgeable about matters than her and more refined and cultured.

Ibn Abbas reports in a lengthy Narration about the marriage of Fatima az-Zahra, *"The Prophet's female family members gathered with him at Aisha's house that day to ask him to grant Fatima permission to enter Ali's house. They stared at him and*

said: We sacrifice our fathers and mothers for you, O Messenger of Allah. We have gathered for a matter that if Khadija were alive, she would have been delighted."

Umm Salamah said, *"When we mentioned Khadija, the Messenger of Allah (p) started to cry and then said, 'Khadija! And who is like Khadija? She believed in me when people rejected me, supported me to raise the religion of Allah, and supported me with her wealth...!'"* (40)

As for the relationship with the Prophet's wife, Aisha, who was the head of one of the two parties of the Prophet's wives, as mentioned by Al-Bukhari, the two sects differ on it. The Sunni sources allege that their relationship was utterly harmonious to the point that the Prophet told his daughter that he loved Aisha and that she should as well, ordering her to love Aisha. As stated in their main sources, this event took place after some of the Prophet's wives sent Fatima so that she could tell her father to be "fair" with all of them and not prefer Aisha over them.

"The wives of Allah's Apostle sent Fatima... she said: *"Allah's Messenger, certainly, your wives have sent me to you to ask you to observe equity in the case of the daughter of Abu Quhafa."* She (A'isha) said: *I kept quiet.* Thereupon Allah's Messenger said to Fatima: *O daughter, don't you love whom I love?* She said: *Yes, (I do).* Thereupon, he said: *"Then, love this one"* (41). Fatima then stood up as she heard this from Allāh's Messenger and went to the wives of Allāh's Apostle and informed them of what she had said to him and what Allāh's Messenger had said to her. Thereupon, they said to her: *"We think you have been of no avail to us. You may again go to Allah's Messenger and tell*

him that his wives seek equity in the case of the daughter of Abu Quhafa." Fatima said: "By Allah, I will never talk to him about this matter."

Also, their sources show that Aisha has narrations on the virtues of Fatima, which indicates a positive relationship between them, such as her saying, *"I have never seen anyone closer in conduct, way, and manners to that of the Messenger of Allah in regards to standing and sitting, than Fatimah the daughter of the Messenger of Allah,"* She said *"Whenever she would enter upon the Prophet he would stand up to her, kiss and hug her, and he would sit her in his sitting place. Whenever the Prophet entered her presence, she would stand from her seat, kiss and hug him, and sit him in her sitting place..."*

Some of their scholars have actually written on this topic and dedicated an entire chapter to the "good relation" of the Prophet's wife Aisha with Fatima, to prove that *"Aisha's relationship with Fatima is a relationship of affection, love, harmony, respect, and appreciation. It has not been proven in any authentic narration that they carried hatred or envy towards the other. Rather, biographers and narrators unanimously agreed that the relationship between Aisha and Fatima was as peaceful and affectionate, like the best of any relationship..."* (42)

On the other hand, the Imami sources indicate that the relationship between the wife of the Prophet, Aisha, and his daughter, Fatima, was turbulent and closer to tension than harmony. They narrate, on the authority of Al-Saduq in Al-Khisal, that Aisha used to despise Khadija and did not see her as superior to her. She belittled her in front of her daughter Fatima,

which made Fatima cry. The Prophet once entered during such a situation and defended his daughter Fatima and his late wife Khadija while criticizing Aisha ⁽⁴³⁾.

Additionally, these sources note that Fatima ordered that no one enter her presence, so when Aisha came to enter, Asma' bint Umayy Al-Khathamiyah (the wife of her father, Abu Bakr) prevented her and told her about Fatima's (s) order ⁽⁴⁴⁾.

It is as if the matter is so obvious that even non-Imamis have mentioned this in their books. Perhaps for this reason, Aisha did not offer condolences when Fatima az-Zahra died, unlike the rest of the Prophet's wives, as mentioned in Sharh Al-Nahj by Ibn Abi Al-Hadid. He states, *"Then Fatima died, so the wives of the Messenger of Allah all came to Bani Hashim for the condolences except Aisha, for she did not come and claimed she was sick."* ⁽⁴⁵⁾

As for the rest of the Prophet's wives, it appears that they were influenced by their party!

10. Fatima After the Demise of the Prophet:

The loss of the Prophet brought Fatima misery and anguish, which is illustrated in her famous poem:

"And what would be [the loss of a person] who smells the soil of Ahmad's grave and then does not smell any other fragrance throughout his life.

I have witnessed so many hardships that had such difficulties have been burdened on the days; they would have converted to nights." ⁽⁴⁶⁾

This meaning is raised in Al-Kafi's narration on the authority of Imam Muhammad Al-Baqir, who said, *"When the Messenger of Allah passed away, the family of Muhammad (p) experienced the longest night. They felt as if the sky did not provide them with any cover and the earth did not hold them up anymore."* (47)

What happened to Amir Al-Mu'minin after the Prophet's demise increased her pain and sadness as he was barred from his rightful leadership position. How the new caliphate dealt with her and Amir Al-Mu'minin added insult to injury. As she pointed out in her sermon.

The two schools differ regarding the second case, whether it be in the origin of events or in the details. In the Sunni sources, the events are described as follows:

- A.** Fatima and Al-Abbas came to demand Abu Bakr to give her inheritance from the Messenger of Allah, to which he replied that he heard the Messenger say that none would inherit from him and that what he left behind was to be used for charity.
- B.** As a result, Fatima became furious and abandoned him! She did not speak with him until she died, and when she died, her husband, Ali, prepared her funeral and never told Abu Bakr until he buried her. Some sources may add that Abu Bakr asked Fatima for her forgiveness (s) before she died, and she accepted, which ended the problem.
- C.** When Fatima died, Ali lost most support from the believers, and he was forced to pledge allegiance to Abu Bakr!

For example, Al-Tabari briefly discusses the events and includes the points mentioned above in his book. What is interesting is that he cites a report on the authority of Aisha, Mother of the Believers, which states, "Fatima and Al-Abbas came to Abu Bakr, seeking their inheritance from Allah's Messenger and at that time, they were asking for their land in Fadak and their shares from Khaybar which Abu Bakr confiscated. Abu Bakr told them, *"I have heard Allah's Messenger (p) saying, 'Our property cannot be inherited, and whatever we leave is to be spent in charity, but the family of Muhammad may take their provisions from this property.'*" Abu Bakr added, *"By Allah, I will not deviate from the Prophet's guidelines and acts."* So, Abu Bakr refused to give anything of that to Fatima. So, she became angry with Abu Bakr, kept away from him, and abandoned him till she died. She remained alive for six months after the death of the Prophet. When she died, Ali buried her at night without informing Abu Bakr, and he said the funeral prayer by himself. When Fatima was alive, the people used to respect Ali, but after her death, Ali noticed a change in the people's attitude towards him. So, Ali sought reconciliation with Abu Bakr and gave him an oath of allegiance."

Mu'ammarr said, "A man asked Al-Zuhri, 'He did not pledge allegiance for six months? He said, 'No, neither did anyone from Banu Hashim until Ali pledged allegiance. When Ali saw that the people's faces were turning away from him, he sought to reconcile with Abu Bakr' ⁽⁴⁸⁾

A similar text is mentioned in Ibn Katheer's Al-Bidayah Wan Nihayah.

But before that, he brings up what he considers fabricated narrations about her marriage and says that he will not mention them because he “desires to not to”. We find it amusing that he did not turn away from the false narration that Ali angered Fatima and the Prophet for wanting to marry the daughter of Abu Jahl. Firstly, he is the one who says about their relationship that he never angered her, nor did she anger him, as previously mentioned in a narration regarding their marriage. But secondly, why would the Prophet and Fatima express anger when Imam Ali was not asking permission for something forbidden. Taking multiple wives is known by Muslim and non-Muslim alike to be permissible in the religion. Thirdly, if the Prophet took offense simply because the hypothetical girl was the daughter of Abu Jahl, then what do the likes of Ibn Kathir say about the Prophet’s silence when marrying the daughter of Abu Sufyan himself?

Ibn Kathir intended to say that Fatima’s anger and pain are not related to what happened after the Prophet’s death, but rather it is because of Ali, who wanted to marry another woman. He cites a narration that he alleges is from the Messenger of Allah, which states that Fatima would be subjected to trials in her religion (because of her jealousy) and that the Prophet gave Ali the choice of divorcing her and marrying Abu Jahl’s daughter!

Due to his lousy attitude towards Ali, he did not notice that with such statements, he was offending Fatima by portraying her in an insulting way. He pictures her as a woman who is like any other woman whose husband married another and becomes jealous. Fatima’s religion, in the opinion of Ibn Katheer

and Al-Miswar ibn Makhramah ⁽⁴⁹⁾ (the fabricator of the narration at hand), is so weak that her faith evaporates simply because her husband married another! He did not notice he was even offending the Messenger of Allah with this, as – according to their narration – he did not adhere to Islamic law, which allows polygamy nor his personal life, as he married more than one wife.

How many hoops must they jump through simply to keep the anger of Fatima away from Abu Bakr and his illegitimate government?

After that, he focused on the points we mentioned above and said:

“And when the Messenger of Allah passed away, she [Fatima] asked Abu Bakr for her inheritance. He told her that the Messenger of Allah said, *‘Our property will not be inherited; whatever we [i.e., prophets] leave is to be used for charity.’* She asked that her husband be responsible for this charity ⁽⁵⁰⁾, but he refused and said, *‘I will sponsor those whom the Messenger of Allah used to sponsor and I will spend on those whom the Messenger of Allah used to spend. I fear that I will fall astray if I leave something of what the Messenger of Allah did. By Allah, I love to support the Messenger’s relatives more than my relatives.’* She became enraged by the event and remained angry throughout her life. When she fell ill, Abu Bakr came to her, entered her presence, and wanted to defuse her anger. He said, *‘By Allah, I have left my house, my wealth, my family, and my clan, in pursuit of the satisfaction of Allah, the satisfaction of His Messenger, and the satisfaction of you, the Ahl al-Bayt.’* So, she became pleased.

It has been proven in an authentic narration that Ali was a respected figure among the people during the lifetime of Fatima, but when she died, he sought the pledge of allegiance to Abu Bakr, so he pledged allegiance to him." (51) The reader may wonder why the delay in Ali's pledging allegiance and the death of Fatima since Abu Bakr had pleased her and she accepted his apology.

On the other hand, Imami sources mention numerous events in detail; we point out a few as follows:

Firstly, these sources separate between the issue of az-Zahra's issue of Fadak and Ali's being barred from his leadership position, which was appointed to him by the Messenger on many occasions, the last and most famous of which was during the event of Ghadīr. Limiting the issue to the subject of Fadak or guardianship over it - as mentioned in some reports from Sunni sources - is reductive and only clouds the issue.

Although the topic of Fadak is a clear practical application of the transgression of the rights of the Prophet's family and a prominent headline, Lady Zahra did not mention Fadak in her sermon. Instead, she mentions, *"Why did they resent Ali? They resented him for his sword's killing, his carelessness about his death..."*

Secondly, these sources insist that Ali is the deserving figure to hold the position of Caliph and Imam. This is on the grounds of his merits such as knowledge, courage, etc., and most importantly, his appointment by Allāh as communicated to humanity by the Prophet. He refused to pledge allegiance to anyone else and stated in multiple protests that they "used the

tree as an excuse and overlooked the fruit." This famous poem is attributed to him:

"If by referendum you control their affairs And if you are a relative, you argued how is that the case yet the counselors are absent? Then someone else is closer to the Prophet!"

He did not pay allegiance, unlike others who rushed and left the Prophet's body unburied, who rushed to the Saqifa of Bani Sa'idah. He kept silent about them while they did not remain silent about him. Rather, there was a determination among the regime to force every important figure to pledge allegiance to them despite the consequences! ⁽⁵²⁾

Thirdly, as a result, the regime mobilized its supporters, since they anticipated that Ali would shelter himself in his residence and gather crowds to oppose them, and used the threat of force to get Ali to exit his house; otherwise, they would burn it with everyone inside, even if Fatima was inside!

The house was stormed by force when Ali refused to exit and pay allegiance. The Imami narratives here say that for Fati-mah al-Zahra to protect her sanctity, and as she was surprised by the attack, she concealed herself behind the door so that she would not be exposed to the attacking men, as is the case with every chaste woman. Subsequently, she was squeezed between the wall and the door, which led to her miscarriage of Muhsin.

In addition to their sources, Shia scholars have completed the picture by referring to several sources from the Sunni sect that cite detailed or brief aspects of the events⁽⁵³⁾.

Fourthly, the primary objective was to force Ali to pay allegiance to the caliphate. Therefore, he was taken by what we would call today "mafia thugs" to the capitol to pledge allegiance. They threatened him that if he refrained from pledging allegiance, he would be killed! Imami sources speak of a commandment from the Prophet to Ali that forbade him from fighting back if he did not have 40 supporters behind him, which would cause a civil war among Muslims after the Prophet. The Imam, therefore, bore all that pain, adopted patience, and pledged allegiance, *"I was patient, although there was a mote rankling in my eye and a bone sticking in my throat on seeing my heritage being plundered."* (54)

Fifthly, Imami sources mention that Fatima publicly protested the situation by delivering her famous sermon in the mosque to a crowd of men. She also addressed the women of the Ansar with a similar intensity to the first sermon while maintaining her hijab and respect.

She accused the Qurashi clan of its old plan to eliminate the Divine Message in the two sermons. She highlighted that Ali and those with him were loyal, striving, and dedicated to the Islamic call. She also accused them of violating the Qur'ān regarding the issue of her inheritance from her father, warning them that their actions would open the doors of calamity to the nation. *"They will milk pure blood and fatal venom to the full of the bucket! Then those who utter false things will perish, and those yet to come will know what evil the earlier generations have established. Therefore, be at ease and wait patiently for the sedition. Rejoice at a sharp sword, an assault of a tyrant enemy, general commotion, and despotism, which will make your pro-*

visions so insignificant and your gathering separate. Alas, what a pity! How will you be while it has been obscured from your sights? (Shall we then force you to accept it when you are opposed to it)"? (55)

One can claim that this was driven by the guidance of Imam Ali, for when Muawiyah criticized him for that, he responded, *"You wanted to criticize me, but you praised me!" (56)*

Sixthly, these sources view - based on reports from Ahlul Bayt - that az-Zahra's death was not of natural cause, given that she was only eighteen years old. Rather, her death was a result of complications caused by her miscarriage. It is mentioned that her ribs were bruised as a result of the assault during the raid, which is something that does not require much effort to prove if it is proven that she was behind the door.

For this reason, as well as many others, she passed away upset with Abu Bakr and Umar. Although this expression has been changed and altered, the truth is that she died while she was enraged. That is why she instructed Ali not to allow anyone from the regime to witness her funeral. After her death, Asma' bint Umayy banned any woman who was in agreement with the opposition to Ahlul Bayt from participating in the washing and shrouding of Fatima's body. She also hid the date and location of her funeral and grave so that they could not partake.

"CONCEALING LIKE A FETUS IN ITS MOTHER'S WOMB"

It has been reported on the authority of Imam Ja'far Al-Sadiq, *"When Fatima walked away from Abu Bakr, she went to Ali and told him, 'O son of Abu Talib! You are concealing like a fetus in its mother's womb ⁽⁵⁷⁾ and hiding like a fugitive! You plucked the feathers of eagles' wings, but now you cannot pluck those of feeble birds? This man has snatched my father's gift and my offspring's livelihood. He strives to quarrel with me and argues with me so harshly that the Ansar have given up aiding me, and the Muhajirin have ruptured the bonds of friendship. Everybody has abandoned me; nobody supports me, and nobody stops them. I got out with anger and returned with cruelty. I wish – but have no choice - I had died before this cruelty. Allah will ask*

you to forgive me for what I told you and the lack of reverence I showed. Woe betide me in every morning! My support passed away. I will complain to my Lord and grieve to my father! O Allāh! Your power and strength are endless, and your chastisement and punishment are severer!." (58)

This statement by Al-Zahra raised - and continues to raise - questions. To the point that some would deny that Fatima ever addressed Ali in this manner. They claim that it contains criticism of the Imam and verbal attacks inconsistent with how she usually speaks with him. Hence, there is no way to believe that she would say these words.

The response to this claim has been mentioned by previous scholars. Allama Majlisi in his Bihar pointed out the matter and answers the skepticism around the dialogue. Here, we will highlight some of the points he uses in his answer and determine what is credible:

The First Point: Regardless of the narrative aspect - which will be discussed later - given the textual criticism - which some scholars view as a preferable manner to attribute statements to its author over criticism of the chain of reporters - we will notice that the Arabic speech does not differ in its strength, power of meaning, and eloquence from the sermon that Fatima delivered preceding it. Rather, if we were to put them together, you would not notice any difference! The speech's intensity and the words' power are the same.

The explanation for this is how some of our scholars say that some reports and narrations that have reached us do not require an examination of their chain of transmission because

of the strength of their text. This is the case in Dua' Al-Sabah, Dua' Kumayl, and the supplications in Al-Sahifa Al-Sajjadiyah. A non-infallible would never be able to craft such statements with the levels of meanings and impact that these do.

Similarly, many scholars respond to the skepticism regarding the attribution of Nahjul Balagha's sermons and letters to Ali. They respond, "Anyone accustomed to skillful speech and elocution, possess a degree of knowledge in rhetoric, and attains a taste in this matter, distinguishes between inarticulate and eloquent speeches, between the different levels of eloquent speeches, and between classical and modern [usages]. Suppose they come across one booklet that includes dialog by a group of preachers or by two. In that case, they can distinguish between them and the two styles. Don't you see that with our knowledge of poetry and its criticism, if we browsed through Abu Tammam's collections and there were poems in it, or one poem written by others; we would know it because it differs from Abu Tammam's style of poetry...

If you examine Nahj Al-Balagha, you will find that it is all the same in one style. It is like a simple body, some of whose parts are not different from the rest in essence. It is like the glorious Quran, its beginning is like its middle, and its middle is like its end. Every surah of it, and every verse is similar in its take and doctrine as the rest of the verses and Surahs..." (59)

What we have discussed applies directly to Lady az-Zahra's dialogue with Ali.

The Second Point: This speech is narrated by Sheikh Tusi in his book Amali, with his chain of transmission on the authority

of Imam Ja'far Al-Sadiq, Ibn Shahr Ashub in Al-Manaqib ⁽⁶⁰⁾ and Sheikh Al-Tabarsi in his book Al-Ihtijaj ⁽⁶¹⁾ also cite the speech. It is also transmitted by Yusuf bin Hatim Al-Shami in his book Al-Durr Al-Nazim ⁽⁶²⁾. It appears from his report that this speech is part of the events that Ibn Abbas narrates on the authority of Zainab bint Ali, the daughter of Ali and Fatima.

It is also reported in the margins of a copy of Kashf Al-Ghumma. Al-Majlisi in Al-Bihar [29/311] states, "I found in an old copy of Kashf Al-Ghumma - copied from the author's handwriting - written in its margin after the citation her sermon, 'It was found in the handwriting of Al-Sayed Al-Murtaza Alam Al-Huda Al-Musawi: 'when she came out..,' then he explained its difficult terms." ⁽⁶³⁾.

The Third Point: Some skepticism about the issuance of this speech is a result of their understanding that the speech is a verbal insult to the Imam and entirely disrespectful towards him, with the fact that Fatima would not act rudely with her Imam. Therefore, they reject the possibility of this speech even if it was transmitted by the highest and most authentic chains of narration.

The answer to that is that it would be correct if the only explanation for the speech was the mentioned disrespectful meaning. However, one can assume that there is another understanding of the speech. In that case, rejecting its issuance may not be correct, especially if those interpretations are contrary to what was mentioned a little while ago. Let us see how these words are interpreted.

The first explanation is what Allama Majlisi states: "We could say that these words were issued by her based on certain interests. She did not oppose what he did, rather, she was content. Instead, the speech aimed to clarify to the public the ugliness of their actions, the heinousness of their deeds, and that his silence in the face of the caliphate was not to be interpreted as him being pleased with what they did.

Such a thing often happens in ordinary affairs and conversations. Imagine if a king were to harshly criticize one of his advisors for something citizens committed - even though the king knows that the elite is innocent - to show the public the severity of the citizens' crime, and that even if the king's closest advisors were to do such a crime, they too would be publicly censured. Parents often do this with elder children to teach their younger children who did not know any better when doing something that displeased the parent.

An example is what Moses did when he returned to his people angry and grieved, by throwing the tablets and taking his brother by the hair of his head, dragging him towards him. His purpose was not to denounce Aaron, rather he wanted the people to realize the severity of their crime, as mentioned earlier." (64).

I say: This is similar to the method of the famous paradigm used in Arabic of *"I am addressing you, but O' neighbor, listen up!"* We find this method throughout the Qur'ān, as Allāh addresses the Prophet with And it was already revealed to you and to those before you that if you should associate [anything] with Allāh, your work would surely become worthless, and you would surely be among the losers and And if We had not

strengthened you, you would have almost inclined to them a little and Then [if you had], We would have made you taste double [punishment in] life and double [after] death. Then you would not find for yourself against Us a helper

The well-regarded narration from Imam al-Sadiq, reported by Al-Kulayni in Al-Kafi, indicates that this method is common in the Qur'ān, *"On the authority of Abu Abdullah (s), he said, 'The Holy Qur'ān was revealed in a manner of, "I am addressing you, but O' neighbor, listen up!". It is narrated, from Abu Abdullah, who has said the following, 'The meaning of "I am addressing you, but O' neighbor, listen up!" is that whenever Allah (s.w.t) has addressed His Messenger in harsh expressions they, in fact, are addressed to others and not the Holy Prophet such as: And if We had not strengthened you, you would have almost inclined to them a little is addressed to others (not the Holy Prophet)."* (67).

Majlisi's commentary and explanation regarding the issue are of this nature.

The second explanation is what Sayed al-Rouhani answers in response to whether Al-Zahra gave that address. He states, "Upon reflecting on the remarks, it appears that the leader of the women, who knows the true value of the Imam, is praising him for his heroism, perseverance, and integrity. She returned after performing her duty to comfort Ali, to honor him, and out of her high respect towards him.

She says, 'You are concealing like a fetus in its mother's womb' meaning you are enduring harm for Allāh's satisfaction. Her expression of "You are concealing" implies that he is hiding

in this veil, which is a veil of protection from the world and its trappings, including the love of leadership and power, by will and choice on his part, not due to shortcomings or negligence, as he was able to oppose, but in return, he embraced the fetus and did not move a muscle. His responsibility was to remain silent and patient, so it is as if she was encouraging him to act according to his responsibilities, stating that just as he was bold when his duty was Jihad, he was patient in enduring harm for Allāh's sake when his task was to remain silent." (68).

One can debate against this explanation by shedding light on the fact that she was not declaring any approval. Rather, the apparent meaning of the words suggests that she was in a state of disapproval and criticism. This is clarified when reflecting on some of her phrases, such as: *"This man has snatched my father's gift and my offspring's livelihood"* and *"Woe betide me in every morning! My support passed away. I will make a complaint to my lord, and grief to my father!"*

Therefore, we do not understand what was meant as, *"so it is as if she (s) was applauding him for acting according to his responsibilities, stating that just as he was bold when his duty was Jihad, he was patient in enduring harm for Allah's sake when his task was to remain silent."*

The third explanation which is mentioned by some scholars is that this speech was a matter of presenting a false front to protect Imam Ali (s). In order to ward off any accusations against that the Imam was the one who motivated her to preach and expose the regime, she had to address the Imam with these words. Given that the speech took place in az-Zahra's house,

which adjoins the Prophet's Mosque, it could not have been hidden from the public!

It is as if she said to him so that those people could hear, and therefore fend off any accusations! *'You did not defend me and could have done so, but you decided to sit!'* Therefore, it is a statement that can be described as presenting a false front, with its purpose being to protect the Imam and fend off any accusations that he was provoking an insurrection or creating chaos to overthrow the rulers.

Analyzing this answer, there remains a question: even if we were to accept it, was there a need for this amount of intensity in the speech and the overemphasis of pain and grief to the point of, "Woe betide me in every morning! My support passed away. I will complain to my Lord and grieve to my father!"? Does the presentation of a false front require this much exaggeration? We leave it to the reader to decide.

The fourth explanation, which we believe is the best explanation, while not necessarily contradicting the others - is that Lady az-Zahra, through this heated and powerful speech, wants to declare, and forever be remembered, that she is the owner of a right that has been usurped in front of the public and the masses of people, whether the Ansar or Muhajireen!

She made this clear to them and went out to them – even though she is the one who does not go out in public- with a stormy and long sermon and made a strong argument against them. Yet, none of the people who were expected to treat the Prophet's daughter well after his demise did anything. Rather, they let him and his daughter down, as they failed to support

her in her first need after the Prophet!

Therefore, she wanted to announce her anger to history; To prove to those who forged lies about her rage and covered up key points of her sermon. She was not wrong about her claim, and it was false when the Caliph told her she was wrong.

She said: *No... I wish I had died before this! My heart is still burning! I have not and will not accept the oppression and injustice!* And even more so, when they envied the Imam and removed him from his proper position.

Therefore, she continued to protest by all means! If the women of the Ansar asked her about her state, she would tell them: *I have become a hater of your men...those who have despicable attitudes!* If the leaders of the Caliphate wanted to appease her, she would refuse and tell everyone that she was not satisfied, and she would die angry! This speech towards Imam Ali (s) was within this framework. Therefore, it is a testimony: An explicit and final declaration of her view and position on the Caliphate!

Doesn't Bravery Stipulate That the Imam (s) Should Confront the Assault?

One of the issues that sectarians focus on in religious debates is the bravery of Imām Ali and his protectiveness over his women and household (in Arabic this is a chivalrous concept known as gheera). They harp on these traits so that they can pretend to be lovers of Ali while pushing themselves into further confusion, for in their minds, there is a dichotomy between the Ali they claim to love and the one who sits and does not defend his wife from the mobs. They pointedly ask, 'If the attack took place what happened to the brave Imām Ali? A protective man, they point out, would not sit and watch a man break into his house and crush his wife between the wall and door. Nor would he watch without flinching as another man slaps his wife

on the face! Therefore, if the Imāmis transmit the narrations of the attack, assault, and miscarriage, then they will either have to believe that Imām Ali lacked gheera and was not brave, or they must deny these narrations,

Before addressing this issue, we would like to firmly and unequivocally state -- as a matter of fact, not opinion -- that these sectarians do not hold any value for Imām Ali whatsoever. Any imagined value they think they hold for him only comes out when trying to prove something to a Shia, but they do not fool anyone but themselves with this lip service. It is easy for them to describe him as not having courage or gheera, since they view him like any ordinary companion of the Prophet. They regularly cite, and truly believe in, what was fabricated by those who envy the Imam, that he does have any virtues that surpass him over others ⁽⁶⁹⁾. These individuals also state that Imām Ali made seventeen different mistakes and acted in violation of the Qur'ān. ⁽⁷⁰⁾

They say all this while the Prophet said, "Ali is with the Qur'ān, and the Qur'ān is with Ali." In another famous narration (of the two weighty things), the Prophet further said Ali (along with the rest of the progeny) would never separate from the Qur'ān until they reunited with the Prophet at the pond on Judgement day. We ask these stubborn and intent haters of Ali whether they would like to re-think their positions or risk being on the opposite side of the Qur'ān and the Prophet if it meant they could die firm on their hate of Ali. But after that question, we leave that choice between them and their Lord and waste no more thought or care, as we consider this to be sufficient proof (hujjah) on these sectarians.

In any case, the reader should not think we are trying to engage or even address these people, such an endeavor would be futile, for *Indeed, you will not make the dead hear, nor will you make the deaf hear the call when they have turned their backs retreating.*⁽⁷¹⁾ Rather, we are addressing those whom these suspicions may have reached and created unrest in their hearts. Therefore we say:

1. It should not come as a surprise to anyone that they have hyper-focused on the matter of whether the attack on Lady Fatima's house occurred. This is one of the few historical events that will undoubtedly influence doctrinal positions. For if the attack is proven to any degree, it immediately becomes an irrefutable argument against the regime of the usurpers and their school of thought. It means that their reign started by attacking the house of their own Messenger, whom they feigned allegiance to; a house that is praised in the Qur'ān, while in it were Hassan and Hussain, Fatima, and Ali, who respectively are Masters of the Denizens of Paradise, the Leader of the Women of All Time and Generations, and the Master of the Believers. With what hope can any self-respecting Muslim oppose such a powerful household, when they are his leaders in this life and the next? Yet, the cognitive dissonance does not allow them to realize how brutally this household was dealt with within the hours and days following the burial of the Prophet of Islam. However, even through that dazed and dulled approach to Islam, this event is sharp enough to pierce through and evoke emotions and start the uninitiated down a path of some dangerous questions. Questions that they would not be able to answer.

And so, they have deemed it easier to attempt to completely deny the incident from its conceptual form and fight to erase it from the annals of history. What they do not realize, is they are acting like someone attempting to cover the sun with a sieve or someone who is trying to black it with a tent. This is because, little do they know, the crimes of the caliphs and their regime extend back much further than their dealings with the Ahlul Bayt after the Prophet. Rather this is just another expected action from their ilk after their dismal report card of being in the Prophetic school for 22 ½ years. For the one who knows that a wild animal lashes out and attacks when it does not get its hedonistic wishes, the next chaotic outburst is not a surprise, it is expected. Similarly, from the ones who tried to murder the Prophet and undermine his mission on so many occasions, such a careless regard for the life of his family in their sloppy campaign to consolidate their power grab comes as no surprise to those with the faculty to see.

Their best way is to shun the idea, making it look repulsive and seem impossible. However they do not focus on how impossible they feel it would be for their saints and heroes to act evilly, they rather would have you focus on the issue of Ali's courage and zeal, and set up the doubt in your mind of the brave Ali, cowardly backing down from a fight.

God-willing, we will provide our answer in the coming points.

2. The Imamis here provide two replies, the first demonstrating that the claims the opponents have put forward contradict some of the beliefs they themselves hold, and the second explaining the solution to the case they have put forward for the Imami to solve.

The first reply: We start by asking: Isn't Allāh capable of protecting? If Allah has power over all things and is the Creator of this phenomenon of gheera in humans, then why were God's prophets not supported? Some of the prophets were sawed in half, others were thrown into the fire, and believers in Allāh from all eras were tortured with the most severe punishments by various tyrants. All these awful events happened under the watch of Allāh, moment by moment. So why didn't Allah use his power and ability to destroy the oppressors and restrain them from carrying out that torment?

Then we come down and reflect on His servants. The Messenger of Allāh was described in the Qur'ān as "There has certainly come to you a Messenger from among yourselves. Heavy on him is what you go through, and especially to the believers he is excessively caring and loving"⁽⁷²⁾. So why did the Prophet leave Yassir's family while Abu Jahl stabbed Sumayya with a spear in her heart and not draw a sword in the face of her executioners and tormentors? He only supported them by saying, **"O members of the family of Yassir, be patient! For you have been promised Paradise."**

We believe that the Messenger of Allah is stronger and braver than Ali ibn Abi Talib and the rest of the people. He could have personally taught them a lesson they would never forget. So why didn't he? Moreover, why didn't he defend himself when the Quraysh put a camel's intestines on his back or when they stoned his house? Wasn't he protective of his companions and those who believed in him? Wasn't he brave enough to protect himself from harm?

All these questions, whether about Allāh or the Prophet, are

the same being asked of the Imam. The answer to all of them is also the same. The question is not a matter of the presence of bravery or gheera, rather, it is about the use of that strength, courage, and protectiveness. There must be a legitimate rational reason, which also serves the ultimate goal that this brave and protective person is concerned about. Therefore, if the use of strength was for an illegitimate purpose or out of line with serving his goals, it would be considered irrational and foolish.

3. The second reply: The Imāmis believe that Ali was the bravest and most protective of all after the Prophet. Yet, his bravery and gheera were neither foolish nor liberally applied. They were controlled responsibly by the high expectations of Islamic rule and practical wisdom.

Sometimes, we may find people who have strength and courage, yet they will use it on anyone at any time, thinking "Should anyone want to try any funny business with me, I will teach them such a lesson they will know never to cross paths with me ever again". If a person assaulted them or killed a member of their clan, they would respond by killing ten. If someone insulted them with a word, they would curse back at them with hundreds of words. They would have no objection if a small matter would lead to a fight. This pre-Islamic spirit of fool's bravado used to rule people previously and can still be found in many in the present day.

On the other hand, there are brave warriors whom no one dares to confront. Yet, they use their courage and strength only within the agenda of what is permissible or obligated by Islamic law. They do not use their power for personal revenge or to feed their anger. At the forefront of those brave men was

Ali. Therefore when he was ordered to not draw his sword by his master, the holy Prophet, and not react unless the circumstances were favorable, he would not succumb to a knee-jerk reaction and disobey orders from his superior. That is just if we examine Ali from a secular point of view, as a man of principle and loyalty, what then would be the case when we add to this argument that Ali is not just utterly convinced of the veracity of Islam and is in line with the goals of the Messenger -- he has been named, according to the Imami view and the view of other schools of thought, as the one who is pleased with Allāh and his Messenger, and **they are pleased with him!** If anyone thinks we are saying this simply out of reverence for Ali, we would refer them to Ali's feats at Khandaq, and the praises of the Messenger, when he famously walked away when his person was disrespected, only to come back and finish off Amr ibn Abd al-Wudd, a heroic moment denied by no one.

We therefore not only believe but have solid evidence, that Ali's every action, including those which cannot be understood at first glance, was the result of him disciplining his base desires to be within the framework of the goals of Allāh and the Messenger. Moreover, his strength lay in the restraint of his physical prowess in the face of personal situations. Therefore, when he saw with conviction that the interests of the Prophet's hard work and mission required him to not rise against the regime's brutality, he acted accordingly and donned the cloak of patience.

Even more, he had no objection to being oppressed, as mentioned in his reply to Muawiyah bin Abi Sufyan, "You have said that I was dragged like a camel with a nose string to swear

allegiance (to Abu Bakr at Saqifah). By the Eternal Allah, you had intended to revile me, but you have praised me, and to humiliate me but have yourself been humiliated. What humiliation does it mean for a Muslim to be the victim of oppression as long as he does not entertain any doubt in his religion, nor any misgiving in his firm belief!" (73)

Far from being a coward, by obeying the command of his Prophet, he avoided a civil war between the Muslims, which would have ended the Prophet's 22 ½ years of hard work to bring Islam from Allāh to humanity. All the while, the enemies of Islam lurked in the shadows for the slightest hint of an opportunity to eradicate the Prophet's achievements. If any man, woman, or child wants to claim to have enjoyed the fruits of the Prophet's hard work, he owes thanks to the tact and strategy of the successors of this Prophet, beginning with Ali.

Ali's situation is also the same as when the Prophet and Muslims were restricted from fighting back and resisting the Meccans during their time in Mecca. They were ordered to be patient in all circumstances and then to flee and migrate from their homeland. So why did the Prophet not resist and fight the infidels in Mecca when Allah was able to support him? The reason is that the ruling for fighting was yet to be revealed, and there was no divine permission until the verses: *Permission [to fight] has been given to those who are being fought,[929] because they were wronged. And indeed, Allāh is competent to give them victory,"* (74), were revealed to the Prophet.

4. Some researchers believe that the usurping regime was ready to snatch authority by hook or by crook, without any care for consequences. They had no qualms with killing

anyone who actively stood in their way, or even those who would not pledge allegiance. It is as if the issue of supporting their ambitions was a matter of life or death for them.

An example is the way they dealt with Sa'd ibn Ubādah, who was the chief of the Anṣār in Medina and the most notable figure among them at the time. They ordered their supporters to kill him since he refused to give his allegiance to Abu Bakr at Saqifa. Then, some of them claimed that the jinn murdered him while he went to the latrine. ⁽⁷⁵⁾ It is a wonder that generations of Muslim children all over the world were not traumatized by latrines since according to these companions, jinns plot their assassinations while their target relieves themselves.

If this is what they were capable of with a minor candidate who dared to stand in the way of their ambitions for an afternoon, what would they have done to Imam Ali if they had been given an opportunity? Their frustrations with the Imam extended to their public moaning and groaning against the Prophet, some of which have been recorded in the Qur'ān, such as *"Among them are those who torment the Prophet, and say, 'He is an ear.' I Say, 'An ear that is good for you. He has faith in Allah and trusts the faithful, and is a mercy for those of you who have faith.' As for those who torment the Apostle of Allah, there is a painful punishment for them."*⁽⁷⁶⁾

5. There are some reports that state that the Imam confronted those who raided his house ⁽⁷⁷⁾, but not to the extent that he waged a war or shed blood. The report also indicates that the confrontation did not escalate because the

Imam followed **"prior instructions"** from the Messenger. This is similar to the directive from Allah to the Messenger to not confront the people of Quraysh in Mecca to the point of waging war.

az-Zahra's Virtues and The Denial in The Umayyad School of Thought to Accept Them

Some might deny the status of Prophets, Messengers, their successors, and infallible figures. However, their denial is in varying degrees, so they might accept the status of a Prophet but not their successor, and so forth.

Of course, the Prophet or successor does not suffer any loss due to the ignorance of others of their status, it is the reverse. The more a person has knowledge and awareness about a prophet or successor, the more their belief and faith in him will increase, and the more their imitation of that figure will increase. Similarly, the more a person knows about Allāh, the

more they fear, have hope, glorify, and obey Him.

It is mentioned in a narration on the authority of Imām us-sain, *"Allah did not create His servants except to know Him; then if they know Him, they would worship Him."* ⁽⁷⁸⁾ Another Narration shows the negative side of lack of knowledge, "... a group of people asked Imām aṣ-Ṣādiq, "We pray, but our prayers are never granted." He responded, *"it is because you pray to One whom you do not know."* ⁽⁷⁹⁾ What is meant here is not: one you do not know at all, but rather: one you do not know properly. For this reason, the rank of a servant varies due to a number of factors; among them is the degree of their knowledge of Allah, then of the Prophet, and the successor.

The matter is more apparent when it relates to the status and virtues of Fatima az-Zahra. Followers of the Umayyad mentality deny these virtues to the point they accuse perfectly valid narrations as being exaggerations and lies.

Here we will point out some of the reasons for this denial and rejection:

1. Differences in Sources and Religious References

Each sect has its narrative passed down through the centuries, sources, and respect for religious personalities, which it relies on and shapes the beliefs of its followers. For example, when we talk about the Prophet, his infallibility, his status as the greatest creation of all time, that he was chosen for prophecy while Adam was still clay. All of these ideas are things that the Christians and the Jews cannot reason with. Yet, they are a different religion; it becomes very confusing for followers of the Imami school when their brothers in Ahlus Sunnah often

have major problems in accepting any of these statuses of the Messenger, Even though they believe that he is one of Allah's messengers, many will hesitate to name him as the greatest messenger, and many more will shy away from calling him the greatest of all creations. His pre-existing status as a Prophet from before Adam's creation, and infallibility, although present in Sunni sources, is not only not a popular opinion among their masses, it is widely unknown. It would be one thing if it was a contested issue, yet most of them are simply unaware that these merits for their own Prophet exist in their trusted sources. What hope should a Shia keep for their sources and the far greater accolades and merits that the Prophet and his family have been given? Naturally, such sources will be treated as lies and exaggerations.

Therefore the non-Shia have been mentally raised to reject almost everything about the fourteen infallibles. Their scholars – except for a few shining paragons of resistance - do not teach anything about the statuses and virtues of the infallibles. The scholars treat them as ordinary people, after patting themselves on the back for finally acknowledging them, and at best, they regard them as pious scholars and truthful narrators. They will then pass this lame excuse for lip service off as their love for the Prophet's family.

The followers of Ahlul Bayt anticipate this and therefore they have become adept at proving the statuses and virtues of the infallibles - especially Lady az-Zahra - from the sources of other schools of thought. Erroneously, some think that this is proof that the Shias do not believe in their own books, nor do they rely on them.

This is a dim approach to scholarship, as one of the practices of debate is to provide evidence to the opponent that they accept, not your own. It is known that the followers of the Sunni school do not accept the narrations of the Imams as binding. Therefore, the next best method is to provide evidence against them based on what they accept.

2. Human Boundaries in Analogy

These virtues and statuses relate and belong to the world of the unseen. Mankind's perceptions and knowledge in this world are limited to just the five senses. Meaning even if they were to reach their maximum potential, they would only be able to use these 5 and never anything more since humans are provided with these senses to interact with this world. The horizons and worlds of the unseen are far from these standards and superior.

Yet even these senses are severely limited. Humans cannot see what is even a mile away, let alone ten; nor can they hear the crawling of ants let alone the sound of electrons colliding; They cannot taste sugar in something salty, nor salt in something sweet, even if they are aware of its presence due to the nutrition label. And this is all dealing with the world of seen realities that can be comprehended through the five senses. How then, can humans even begin to understand issues of basic intricacy natures in the unseen, when they do not even possess a single sense to interact with it?

Yet Allah, through prophets and their successors, has made knowledge of the unseen accessible. First by making them of impeccable personal and social character to gain the trust of

tens of billions who would pore over their daily lives, then once that trust was secured, to share meaningful and logically based realities of the unseen, and their effects in the realm of the seen. If Muhammad the messenger of truth and integrity informed us that Fatima is the mistress of the women of the worlds, or her light was created before the creation of the heavens and the earth, or that her dowry is one-fifth of the earth, then whether it is compatible with human understanding or not, it should be believed in as long as it is reported authentically on the authority of the Prophet Muhammad or from any of the legitimate members of Ahlul Bayt, as Shias do not differentiate between their saying and his saying.

3. Mix Up Between Authentic and Fake Virtues

Enemies of all kinds have worked in earnest to distort the image of religion and its symbols by fabricating reports related to virtues, which leaked into sources in both sects. This led to their intermingling with authentic reports, making it difficult for the general public to separate between them. This affected the authentic virtues and sound reports, such that every narration that mentions a virtue has the possibility of being fabricated.

This is what exaggerators have done throughout Islamic history. The trend of exaggerating existed and still exists. This movement played a wicked role in making false reports or misinterpreting authentic reports.

The hideous actions of these two groups affected the reports on virtues and the high status of the symbols of religion and its great personalities.

4. Comparing to One's Self

Many people define and judge others with the bias of their own life experiences. They believe that what others have is no greater than what they have. They do not see a significant difference between themselves and the holy figures. Therefore, they cannot grasp the status of those figures. How can they imagine that Fatima was created from food from Paradise, that she is a human nymph, that she is infallible, and that her light shines [to the creations in the heavens] just as shining stars shine for people on Earth?

This is just a different face of the debunked mentality that Allah addressed with: *This is not but a man like yourselves who wishes to take precedence over you; and if Allāh had willed [to send a messenger], He would have sent down angels. We have not heard of this among our forefathers* ⁽⁸⁰⁾. When all a person knows are the trappings of this world, he is not expected to understand that an infallible figure has been granted virtues and statuses by Allah that transcend his mundane schedule.

5. The Umayyad School of Thought: Deniers of the Infallibles' Virtues:

In addition to what was mentioned above, which may - fully or partially - occur naturally, we witness a trend/attitude throughout Islamic history - not only during the Umayyad era - between Hadith transmitters we like to call (The Umayyad Attitude). This movement intends to erase and deny the virtues and statuses of the Infallible figures except the Messenger (p).

Based on their doctrinal backgrounds and sectarian tendencies, they initially refused to transmit reports on virtues in their

books, causing the reports to be forgotten over time, and they dealt with what remained despite their efforts in a particular way. If they saw a virtue that might affect their dogmas, shed light on the concept of Imamate, point out the successorship after the Prophet (p), prove the enemies of Ahl Al-Bayt wrong, or deal with their (s) high status, they would go crazy trying to deny it and refuse it in any way they can.

Al-Zahra's Virtues Faced All the Matters Together:

1. The Prophet's (p) narration about Fatimah (s) and Fatima's virtues were hidden. You would be surprised to know that Fatima, even though she lived with the Prophet for a period that, according to the Sunni sect, amounted to twenty-eight years (based on their opinion that she was born 5 years prior to the prophet prophecy) and was one of the closest to him, as she was his daughter, a part of him, the joy of his heart, and even his soul, only has one narration on the authority of her father in all of their Sahih books! Only one narration!

Assuming that she heard only one Narration every day from her father from when she was six until his demise, she would have over eight thousand Narrations! How? We have seen some of their narrators who only accompanied the Prophet for a year and a half and reports around five thousand narrations! Yet, they claim that Al-Zahra (s), who has been with him since he was in Mecca, narrates a single Narration on her father's authority?! ⁽⁸⁰⁾

As for the Narrations from the Prophet (s), they either weaken them, distort them from their true meanings, or change the story.

An example of omission is what they did in the narration of the Prophet (p), **"Many amongst men reached (the level of) perfection, However, only four women has reached such respectful level: Asia, Pharaoh's wife, and Mary, the daughter of `Imran, Khadija bint Khuwaylid, and Fatima bint Muhammad..."** ⁽⁸¹⁾ But as this Narration is mentioned in Sahih al-Bukhari, Khadija and Fatima are not mentioned!

In his Tafsir (Explanation), Ibn Kathir mentions that the perfect women are three, as he believes that it was too much for Fatima to be among them. He transmitted the Narration thus: "Many amongst men reached (the level of) perfection, but none amongst the women reached this level except three: Asia, Pharaoh's wife, and Mary, the daughter of `Imran, Khadija bint Khuwaylid."!!

2. In contrast to that, it can be seen that they report statements from the Messenger of Allah (p), which a listener or reader might interpret as criticism of Fatima! This is like their claim that the Messenger of Allah told her when the verse: **(And warn all, starting with your closest relatives)** ⁽⁸²⁾ was revealed, "O Safiyyah bint 'Abdul-Muttalib! O Fatimah bint Muhammed! O Banu' Abdul-Muttalib! I have no authority over Allah on your behalf for anything. Ask me for whatever you want of my wealth." ⁽⁸³⁾ In another text, "O Fatimah, rescue yourself from the hell"

With its ambiguous meaning, such a Narration depicts the mistress of the women of the worlds as if she is about to fall into hell and must save herself and not depend on her father. Some even dare to state that she benefited from the talk!

Other Narrations in that fashion indicate that Fatima did deeds that almost prevented her from Paradise. Like what was reported from 'Abdullah bin' Amr, who said, "While we were traveling with the Messenger of Allah, he saw a woman, and did not think that he knew her. When she was halfway to him, he stopped until she reached him, and it was Fatimah, the daughter of the Messenger of Allah. He asked her, 'What brought you out of your house, O Fatimah?' She said: 'I came to the people of this deceased one to pray for mercy for them and to offer my condolences to them.' He said: 'Perhaps you went with them to Al-Kuda (the graveyard) ?' She said: 'Allah forbid that I should go there. I heard what you said about that.' He said: If you had gone there with them, you would never have seen Paradise until your father's grandfather saw it.'" (84).

They did not find a Narration suitable about Fatima to teach their youth in elementary and middle schools other than the report that if she had stolen, Muhammad would have cut off her hand! So, you see the Narration: "The people before you were destroyed because they used to inflict legal punishments on the poor and forgive the rich. By Him in Whose Hand my soul is! If Fatima [the daughter of the Prophet (p)] did that [i.e., stole], I would cut off her hand." (85), they claim is on the authority of the Messenger (p) in their curriculum and must be taught.

3. Their denial and rejection of the Narrations that mention their (s) virtues requires dedicating a book on the subject. However, we cite some examples:

One of the Narrations they deny is what has been narrated on the authority of Imam Ali (s), who said, **"The Messenger**

of Allah (p) told Fatima, 'Verily Allah is angry at whatever angers you and is pleased with whatever pleases you.' ⁽⁸⁶⁾

Ibn Taymiyya and Al-Dhahabi ⁽⁸⁷⁾ saw this Narration as a threat to their sectarian creeds. Acknowledging that their Sahih books mention that she died angry at their figures and Imams, this would mean that Allah is also angry. They cannot run away from reality except weakening the narration and labeling it as fabricated, a lie, etc.

They did even worse than that! They changed the context of the Narration ⁽⁸⁸⁾, making Ali seem like the one who hurt Fatima and angered her, thus hurting the Messenger of Allah! Look at the Umayyad attitude and harassment of the Prophet's family.

Another instance is their rejection of the reports of her marriage with Ali. The Messenger of Allah said, **"Allah commanded me to marry Fatima to Ali"** which we delved into with detail and put forward that the marriage was Allah's order, "and this is a virtue that is exclusive to Ali and Fatima. Many prominent companions asked to marry her, and the prophet would reply that he is waiting for revelation about the matter." ⁽⁸⁹⁾.

Because the narration includes important meanings – which we discussed previously – Both old and new Umayyad school of thought, declared a state of alert to reject and weaken it. The least they did was to cut it short and summarize it to the point where it remains without the same color, taste, or smell. Consequently, the Narration becomes a story that so-and-so and so-and-so proposed to her, and the Prophet said, "She is still young" ⁽⁹⁰⁾ and that's it!

Based on that, Ibn Al-Jawzi (d. 597) rules that the Narration is fabricated ⁽⁹¹⁾, and Al-Dhahabi adds, "This is fabricated and contains many weaknesses." ⁽⁹²⁾.

This is just the tip of the iceberg and a drop in the ocean of what the Umayyads do in denying the Narrations of Ahl Al-Bayt's (s) virtues. They reject them and never transmit them, weaken what has been leaked, or change their context by altering their words, shortening the Narrations or adding to them, changing their scenario, etc.

This issue deserves to be written about in detail and with evidence. Perhaps Allah (s.w.t) will aid a researcher or scholar to work on it so that it will be valuable and beneficial for Muslims.

Endnotes

-
- (1) Al-Saduq states, "We were told by Muhammed bin Musa bin Mutawakkil, may Allah be pleased with him, that he said: We were told by Abdullah bin Ja'far al-Himyari, from Ya'qoub bin Yazid, that he said: We were told by Hasan bin Ali bin Faddal, from Abdul-Rahman bin Hajjaj, from Sudair al-Sayrafi, from al-Sadiq, Ja'far bin Muhammed, from his father, from his grandfather, peace be upon them, that he said:...."
 - (2) Ma'ānī al-'Akhbār, P.490. For more information about the creation of the lights of the infallible figures before their birth, which is subject to many Hadiths, review Al-Shiekh Muslim Al-Dawari's book: (The Light of The Prophet), and Al-Shiekh Ismail Al-Ansari Al-Khoeini's (The Great Encyclopedia).
 - (3) This is understood from the sayings that state she was born five years after the start of the Prophet's mission, which is proven in Al-Khoeini's (The Great Encyclopedia).
 - (4) Al-Khoeini states in (The Great Encyclopedia on Fatima Al-Zahra) 2/65, "Her birth was five years after the start of the Prophet's (p) mission, which is based on 106 sources. Among them is what is narrated on the authority of Al-Kafi, with a reliable chain of trans-

mitters, on the authority of Habib Al-Sijistani, who said, 'I heard Abu Ja'far (Al-Baqir) (s) saying, 'Fatima, daughter of Muhammad, may Allah's prayers and peace be upon him and his family, was born five years after the Messenger of Allah was sent, and she died when she was eighteen years and seventy-five days old...' and in this narration both the date of birth and age are mentioned.

- (5) Al-Dhahabi (d. 748 H) denied the Hadith in Al-Mustadrak Al-Sahihayn 3/169 by Abu Abdullah Al-Hakim Al-Nayshaburi (d. 405), and Al-Mu'jam Al-Kabir - the text of which will come shortly - and said, "This is a clear lie; Because Fatima was born before the prophecy, in addition to the Night Journey..." And similar and more surprising than it, Ibn Hajar Al-Asqalani (d. 852) said in Ithaf Al-Mahra 5/134 No. 5066, saying: "The situation is clear, as Fatima was born before the night of the Night Journey, unanimously." He said "Unanimously" even though the narrations of Ahl Al-Bayt clearly state that she was born five years after the prophecy! This shows you the secret of their insistence on proving that Al-Zahra's birth occurred before the prophecy!

You will find copied comments and remarks on the topic as the subject became more active after 700 H, a period of intense sectarian controversy and debate. Burhan Al-Din Sibt Ibn al-Ajami (d. 841) states in his book Al-Kashf Al-Hathith 1/151 these words, "Children know that Gabriel did not descend on our Prophet until sometime after the birth of Fatima. Hence, all of this implies that this [Hadith] is fabricated. Allah knows best." It is the exact phrase that Al-Dhahabi says in Mizan Al-I'tidal 2/416, "Children know that Gabriel did not descend on our Prophet until sometime after the birth of Fatima!"

- (6) Al-Tabarani; Abu Al-Qasim (d. 360): Al-Mu'jam Al-Kabir 22/400, on the authority of Aisha, who said, "I saw the Messenger of Allah (p) frequently kiss Fatima, so I said, 'O Messenger of Allah, I see you doing something that I had never seen you do before?' He replied, 'O Humayra! On the night I was taken up into heaven, I entered Paradise and stood on one of the trees of Paradise. I did not see in Paradise a tree more beautiful than this, nor a leaf whiter than its leaf, no fruit more delicious looking than its fruit. I took one of its fruits and ate it, and it became a drop of seed in my lion. When I returned to the earth, I met with Khadija, and

she became pregnant with Fatima - a human Hourī. Whenever I desire to smell the scent of Paradise, I smell the scent of my daughter Fatima. O Humayra, Fatima is not like ordinary women; she does not menstruate.

- (7) Al-Saduq reports in Al-Amali p.691 on the authority of Imam Sadiq (s), "When Khadija (a.s) married the Messenger of Allah (s), the women of Mecca abandoned her, so no women would visit her or greet her. No women were left to go to her. Khadija (a.s) became lonely because of that, and the Messenger (s) became concerned with her melancholy. So, when she became pregnant with Fatima (s.a), she would speak to her from her womb and console her. Khadija kept this hidden from the Messenger of Allah (s). One day, the Messenger of Allah (s) entered and heard Khadija conversing with Fatima (s.a), so he said to her: Khadija, who are you talking to? She said: The fetus in my womb speaks kindly to me. He said: O Khadija! This Gabriel informs me that she is a female and, that her progeny will be pure and auspicious, and that Allah will make my progeny her progeny. He will make Imams from her progeny, and He will make them the vicegerents in His Earth after the cessation of revelation."
- (8) This is mentioned in many sources, such as the book of Muhammad bin Jarir Al-Tabari (Al-Mukhtab Min Dhayl Al-Mudhayl Min Tarikh Al-Sahaba Wa Al-Ta'been p. 91) and in Ibn Al-Jawzi's (Al-Muntazim 4/95) (d. 597). In fact, Al-Kalbi Al-Nasabah claimed that when she died, she was thirty-five years old! As in Tahdheeb Al-Kamal fi Asma Al-Rijal 35/253 - by Jamal Al-Din Al-Mazzi. What is strange is that they sometimes quote Abdullah bin Al-Hasan bin Al-Hasan Al-Sibt that he said her age was twenty-five and at other times thirty, as in Sharh Mushkil Al-Athar 1/136 - Al-Tahawi (d. 321). The truth, which is what is reported from Ahl Al-Bayt - and they know best about their affairs- is that she was born five years after the mission and was martyred when she was eighteen years old.

Even more, some point out another problem they do not have an answer to. It is mentioned in (The Summary of the Islamic Encyclopedia 25/7711 / by A group of authors), "The most likely date is that she was born in the year of the rebuilding of the Holy Ka'ba, that is, five years before the beginning of the prophetic mission. This means She got married when she was eighteen

years of age. It was not common for an Arab girl's marriage to be delayed until this age!" Do they mean that Fatima was not wanted by anyone? This, while they brag that others got engaged when they were six years old and married when they were nine?!

- (9) Al-Majlisi; Muhammad Baqir (1111 H): Bihar Al-Anwar 45/10: "Imam Hussein (s) addressed the Umayyad army by saying "All of you disobey me and do not listen to me because your stomachs are filled with Haram and your hearts are sealed. Woe to you, do you not keep silent and listen to me"
- (11) Al-Amali p.691.
- (12) Al-Ishbili; Abd Al-Haqq ibn Abd Al-Rahman (d. 582 H), Jam'a Al-Sahihayn 3/83. The Prophet's supplication should be reflected on by those who adorn Hadiths about the "virtues" of Quraysh.
- (13) Al-Mubarakpuri; Safi al-Rahman, Ar-Raheeq Al-Makhtum 1/121: (A few days later, there arrived the Prophet's spouse Sawdah, his two daughters Fatimah and Umm Kulthum, Usama bin Zaid, Umm Aiman, 'Abdullah — son of Abu Bakr with Abu Bakr's household including 'Aishah [R]Ç. Zainab could not emigrate and stayed with her husband Abi Al-'As till the Badr Battle.).

Al-Baladhuri in Ansab Al-Ashraf (1/414) states on the authority of Aisha: (When The Messenger of Allah migrated to Medina, he instructed Zaid bin Haritha and Abu Rafi', his two servants to come to Medina. They carried with them Sawda bint Zam'a, Fatima, and Umm Kulthum. Zaid carried Umm Ayman, his wife, and Usama, his son.).

What is noticeable in this Hadith is the absence of the name of Imam Ali (s) in that he is the one who accompanied the Prophet's family on their journey from Mecca to Medina.

- (14) Imami sources, such as Al-Amali (p.500) by Al-Sheikh Al-Tusi and Al-Manaqib by Ibn Shahrashub, mention that the Prophet - before he migrated from Mecca - advised Ali to be ready to bring the Fatimites and the women of Banu Hashim whenever he is ordered to by the Prophet. Also, he should fulfill the entrustments of the Messenger of Allah during this period and pay off his loans, then leave Mecca in Allah's protection, so there is no need for him to leave secretly! Indeed, when the Prophet arrived in Medina, he sent him Abu Waqid Al-Laythi to urge him to come

and not be late, so Ali (s) went out with Fatima, the daughter of the Messenger, his mother Fatima, daughter of Asad bin Hashim, and Fatima, daughter of Al-Zubayr bin Abdul Muttalib. Ayman bin Umm Ayman, the servant of the Messenger of Allah, and Abu Waqid, the Prophet's Messenger, followed them. Ali (s) went out openly, and when the Quraysh tried to intercept him and repel him, they were answered by his sword. He (s) continued his journey until he reached Medina, as the Prophet was waiting outside Medina and entered it when Ali and Al-Fawatim arrived.

Meanwhile, Sunni sources do not mention Ali in this migration or any journey! He did not migrate with the Prophet, nor did he migrate secretly, nor did he migrate openly, nor with the Fatimites, nor without them! It is as if his name was erased from this event!

- (15) Some narrations mention the Imam's armor alone. Some mention the camel and armor together.
- (16) It is mentioned by Ibn Hibban Al-Basti (d. 354) in Sahih Ibn Hibban - 15/394, Al-Tabarani in Al-Mu'jam Al-Kabir 22/408, Ibn Al-Maghazili (d. 483) in Manaqib Ali 1/413, and Al-Suyuti (d. 911) in Jami' Al-Ahadith 33/ 91 And Al-Muttaqi Al-Hindi (d. 975) in Kanz Al-Ummal 13/6. Nasir Al-Din Al-Albani commented on it in the book Da'eef, Mawarid Al-Dhaman ila Al-Zawa'id 1/171 that its text is objectionable with a weak chain of transmission!

We were not expecting anything else from him! Authentication of this report destroys many foundations on which many, such as Al-Albani, build. But suppose it was in another manner and without showing "severity" in the Prophet's rejection. In that case, Al-Albani and others have no objection to accepting it, such as the report that Abu Bakr and Umar proposed to Fatima, and the Messenger of Allah (p) said, "She is still young." Then Ali proposed and married her! We ask how she is so young when, based on their accounts, she was born five years before the prophecy? This means that she was close to 20 years old. Is this young? How did they accept from the Prophet the excuse that she was young when the Prophet married the daughter of Abu Bakr (Fatima's suitor) when she was nine years old, as mentioned in their Sahihis? The Prophet was then about 53 years old! How was she too young to marry them and not too young to marry

Ali? Questions you can't find answers to!

- (17) Al-Sheikh Al-Saduq, Uyun Akhbar Al-Rida: 1/203.
- (18) There are various sayings by Ahl Al-Bayt (s) about the issue. For Example, "And the Honorable, the Exalted Allah, has not taken charge of marrying off any of His creatures Himself except for the marriage of Eve with Adam, and Zaynab with God's Prophet (s) as He said, '...Then when Zayd had dissolved (his marriage) with her, with the necessary (formality), We joined her in marriage to thee.' So did We join (the Blessed Lady) Fatima (s) in marriage to Ali (s)." [Uyun Akhbar Al-Rida: 1/173]
- (19) Al-Tabarani, Al-Mu'jam Al-Kabir 10/156, and Jalal Al-Din Al-Suyuti in Al-Jami' Al-Saghir 1/258. Al-San'ani said in Al-Tanwir Sharh Al-Kitab, "Allah Almighty commanded me to marry Fatima to Ali." The author mentioned the Hadith in Al-Kabir and narrated it on the authority of Anas. He said, "I was sitting with the Prophet (p) so the revelation overtook him, and when it passed from him, he said, 'O Anas, do you know what Gabriel brought from the Owner of the Throne?' I said, 'May my father and mother be sacrificed for your sake, what did Gabriel bring to you from the Owner of the Throne?' He said: 'Allah has commanded me to marry...' Of course, this Hadith was not accepted by the followers of the Umayyad school of thought, such as Al-Dhahabi, who quoted Ibn Al-Jawzi and said, "This is fabricated and contains many weaknesses."
- (20) Al-Ataridi, Musnad Al-Imam Al-Rida 1/335: Nasr bin Ali Al-Jahdhami states, "I asked Abu Al-Hasan Al-Rida (s) about Fatima's (s)age. He replied, 'Fatima was born five years after the prophecy while Quraysh were building the House. She died when she was eighteen years and seventy-five days old. She lived with the Prophet (p) in Mecca for eight years. She migrated with the Prophet to Medina and resided there for ten years. She remained with Amir Al-Mu'mineen (s) seventy-five days after the death of the Messenger (p). She gave birth to Al-Hassan bin Ali (s) after the migration when she was eleven."
- (21) It is mentioned in some reports that Allah ordained Fatima al-Zahra's (s) dower to be the intercession of sinners from her father's nation. In others, He ordained it to be one-fifth of the earth.

- (22) Al-Hamidi; Ibn Abi Nasr (d. 488): *Jam'a Bayn Al-Sahihayn* 1/93: "... The [Zakat] giver gives him twenty dirhams or two sheep."
- (23) Al-Muzni; Ismail (d. 264): *Sunan Al-Shafi'i* 1/408: The Prophet (p) gave Urwa al-Bariqi a Dinar to buy a sacrificial animal or a sheep. He bought two sheep with it, sold one for a Dinar, and returned to him with a goat and a Dinar. So, he invoked blessings on him in his business dealings, and he was such that if he had bought soil (of the earth), he would have made a profit from it.
- (24) Sura Al-Noor: Verse 36.
- (25) Al-Muwaffaq Al-Khwarizmi; Al-Manaqib, p. 354.
- (26) We find that Al-Zahra (s) helped Ali (s) in earning food through spinning wool. This is mentioned in a narration cited in *Jami' al-Hadith al-Shi'a*, [17/74]: Imam Ali (s) went to a Jewish neighbor called Shimun ibn Hara and told him, "Shimon, give me three Sā of barley and a fleece of wool so that the daughter of Muhammad can spin it for you." So, the Jew gave him the barley and the wool, so he went to Fatima's house and told her, "O daughter of the Messenger of Allah, eat this and spin this." He used to help Fatima (s) with the household chores. In the same book [p.139], on the authority of Ali (s), he said, "The Messenger of Allah, entered upon us while Fatima (s) was sitting by the pot while I was washing the lentils! He said, 'O Abu Al-Hassan!' I said, 'O Prophet of Allah!' He said, 'Listen, and - I only say what my Lord has commanded - There is no man who helps his wife in her house chores except that he is rewarded for every hair on his body a year's worship, fasting, and praying every day in it.'"
- (27) Zanjani Al-Khoeini; Ismail Al-Ansari: *The Great Encyclopedia on Fatima Al-Zahra* 17/129. About ten sources were mentioned for this.
- (28) Al-Buroujerdi: *Jami' al-Hadith al-Shi'a* 20/234, reporting from *Tafsir Al-Ayashi* on the authority of Abu Ja'far Al-Baqir (s).
- (29) This does not conflict with the fact that the verse itself was revealed in the house of Umm Salamah, as is mentioned in a Hadith on the authority of Imam Al-Baqir (s) where he said, "This verse was revealed about to the Messenger of Allah, Ali bin Abi Talib, Fatima, Al-Hasan, and Al-Hussein, peace be upon them, in the house of Umm Salamah."

- (30) Ibn Hanbal; Ahmad (d. 241): Musnad Ahmad 21/434, and Al-Tirmidhi; Muhammad bin Issa (d. 279): Sunan Al-Tirmidhi [Bashar] 5/205.

In another report, it is stated that the period was longer than this and that it was nine months, which is what is reported by Al-Suyuti in Al-Durr Al-Manthur fi Al-Tafsir bi Al-Ma'thur 6/606. He says: Ibn Mardawayh narrated on the authority of Ibn Abbas, who said, "We witnessed the Messenger of God, may God's prayers and peace be upon him and his family, for nine months, coming every day to the door of Ali bin Abi Talib at the time of every prayer, and he said 'May peace and blessings be upon you, O Ahl Al-Bayt [People of the House], (Allah only desires to remove uncleanness from you, O People of the House, and to purify you with a complete purification.) It is Prayer's time; may Allah have mercy on you five times daily.

- (31) Sura Al-Ahzab: Verse 33.

- (32) Al-Nasa'i; Ahmad ibn Shuaib (d. 303): Khasais-e-Ali 1/62, in which he includes a chapter entitled "Mention of the Prophet's saying: 'It is not I who let him in and brought you out. Rather, Allah let him in and brought you out.'" In this chapter, he cites four Hadiths with different chains of transmission and phrases, including that Al-Abbas came to the Prophet (p) and said, "You closed our doors except for Ali's?!" He replied, "I neither opened it nor closed it!"

- (33) Al-Insan: Verses 8 – 9.

- (34) This is the recognized view between Muslims in all sects. Another opinion holds that they - except for Fatima - are stepdaughters of the Prophet (p). We have mentioned this topic in our book (Notable Figures from the Prophet's Family) along with the evidence of the two groups, and we favored the well-known view.

- (35) Al-Saduq reports in Al-Amali [p.450] on the authority of the Messenger of Allah (p) that he said, "O `Ali! Allah put the descendants of every prophet in his loins, and He put my descendants in your loins." In Al-Mu'jam Al-Kabir by Al-Tabarani 3/43, on the authority of Jabir Al-Ansari, he said, "The Messenger of Allah (p), said 'Allah has placed the offspring of every prophet in his loins, and Allah has placed my offspring in the loins of Ali bin

Abi Talib."

(36) Al-Majlisi states in *Mirat Al-Uqul* [5/322], "...and she had a miscarriage with a baby whom the Messenger of Allah (p) named Muhsin..." This is an exceptional matter, as the naming is usually given to the child after he is born alive, but the Prophet (p) preferred to name him early. Does this have special meanings? Strangely, many sources from the Caliph's School referred to him as having died young!

(37) Al-Bukhari; Muhammad bin Ismail (d. 256): *Sahih al-Bukhari* 3/132. This was narrated on the authority of the Mother of the Believers, Aisha, as transmitted by Abd Al-Haqq Al-Ashbili (d. 581) in *Al-Jami' Bayn Al-Sahihayn* 3/572.

We believe that Safiyya was not in this first party and that her actions were different from theirs. It is narrated in Al-Tabarani's *Al Mu'jam Al Kabir* 24/75 and *Sharh Sunan Abu Dawud* by Ibn Ruslan 18/91 that the Messenger of Allah (p) entered on Safiyya while she was crying and asked her: "What makes you cry?" She said, "I have heard Aisha and Hafsa talking [behind me] and saying, 'We are better than Safiyya; we are the cousins of the Prophet and his wives.' He said, 'Tell them how can you be better than me, my father is Harun, my uncle is Musa, and my husband is Muhammad?'" This Hadith is transmitted in other sources more harshly: "The women reproach me and call me, 'A Jew! A daughter of two Jews!'" Such an incident does not indicate the existence of a positive relationship.

Imami sources show evidence that the Prophet ordered her to return to Amir Al-Mu'mineen, Ali (s) [for her affairs]. Al-Mufid in *Al-Amali* [p.271] and Al-Tusi in *Al-Amali* [p.64] report in a Hadith, "Safiyyah, daughter of Hay ibn Akhtab came to the Prophet (p) and said, 'O messenger of Allah, I am not like your other wives who have father, brother and uncle. To whom do you entrust me if anything were to happen to you?' The Prophet, peace be upon him and his progeny, pointing at 'Ali ibn Abi Talib (s) said, 'To him.'"

(38) Umm Salamah's positions on Ahl Al-Bayt, Imam Ali, and his sons were generally very positive. This is evident from many of her narrations regarding their virtues and practical practices. You can review Umm Salamah's chapter in our book (Notable Fig-

ures from the Prophet's Family) for details.

- (39) Al-Tabari (Imami); Muhammad bin Jarir: Dalail Al-Imama [p.81]. In it, on the authority of Ibn Abbas, "Umm Salamah said: The Messenger of Allah married me and entrusted the affairs of his daughter to me. So, I disciplined her and guided her. By Allah, she was more polite than me and knew all things."
- (40) Al-Muwaffaq Al-Khwarizmi: Al-Manaqib 351, in a Hadith, "Umm Salamah said, 'When we mentioned (Khadija), the Messenger of Allah (p), cried and then said, 'Khadija, and where is someone like Khadija! She believed me when people denied me, supported me in the religion of Allah, and helped me with her money. Indeed, Allah commanded me to give Khadija good tidings of a house in Paradise made of emerald reeds, in which there will be no noise or hardship.' Umm, Salamah said, 'So we said, 'We will sacrifice our fathers and mothers for you, O Messenger of Allah; you have not mentioned anything from Khadija without it being so. She has gone to her Lord, so may Allah reward her for that and gather between us and her in Paradise. O Messenger of Allah, this is your brother in religion and your cousin in lineage, Ali bin Abi Talib (p), waiting. He would love for his wife Fatima to enter..." and so on to the end of the Hadith.
- (41) Al-Ashbili; Abd Al-Haqq (d. 581): Al-Jami Bayn Al-Sahihayn 3/572.
- (42) 'Ijla' Al-Haqiqah Fi Sira Ahisha Al-Sidiqa p.102 (by: Yassin Al-Khalifa Al-Tayeb Al-Mahjoub.).
- (43) Al-Saduq reports in Al-Khisal on the authority of Imam Al-Sadiq (s), "Once when Allah's Prophet (p) entered his house, he (p) heard that Ayesha was yelling at Fatimah (p). She was saying, 'O Khadijah's daughter! I swear by Allah that you believe that your Mother was better than us. What was in her that made her nobler than us?' Fatimah was listening to her and cried when she saw the Prophet (p). The Prophet (p) looked at her and asked, 'O daughter of Muhammad! Why are you crying?' She replied, 'Ayesha mentioned my mother's name disrespectfully, and I cried.' The Prophet of God (p) became angry, turned to Ayesha, and said, 'O Homeyra! Be silent. The Blessed the Sublime God has honored kind women who give birth to children. Khadijah - may Allah have mercy upon her - has brought two sons from me.

The first one is called Tahir, Abdullah, or Mutah'har. The second one is called Qasim. Khadijah has delivered four daughters for me: Fatimah (s), Ruqayah, Umm Kulthum, and Zaynab. However, you are one whom God has made barren and have not given birth to any child for me."

- (44) Al-Dhahabi; Siyar A'lam Al-Nubala' 2/129: Fatima said, "...If I die, you and Ali wash me, and let no one enter upon me. When she died, Aisha came to enter, and Asma' said, 'Do not enter.' She complained to Abu Bakr, so he came and stood at the door and spoke to Asma'. She said, 'She ordered me.' He said, 'Do what I told you to do, then leave.' Al-Suyuti also reported this in Jami' al-Hadith 24/450.
- (45) Ibn Abi Al-Hadid: Sharih Nahj Al-Balagha 9/198. Ibn Al-Hadid said, "This is the summary of the words of Sheikh Abi Ya'qub - may Allah bless him and grant him peace - and he was not a Shia.
- (46) Ibn al-Jawzi (d. 597) in Mutheer Al-Gharam Al-Sakin (Dar al-Hadith) [1/489] states, "on the authority of Ali (r) said: "When the Messenger of Allah was buried, Fatima came and stood over his grave and took a handful of dirt from the grave, then she placed it over her eyes and wept, and said:

"And what would be [the loss of a person] who smells the soil of Ahmad's grave and then does not smell any other fragrance throughout his life.

I have witnessed so many hardships that had such difficulties have been burdened on the days; they would have converted to nights."

But Al-Dhahabi (d. 748) in Siyar A'lam Al-Nubala' [3/426], after about a century and, as usual, denied the report, saying, "What is attributed to Fatima and is not authentic," then he mentioned the previous verses. Perhaps he denies it because these verses indicate the oppression of Fatima (s).

Although a large group of authors have referred to the entire verses or specifically the two verses, including Ibn Al-Najjar Al-Baghdadi (d. 643) in his book (Al-Durra al-Thamina fi Akhbar al-Madina) and Abd al-Rahman ibn Qudamah (d. 682) in (Al-Sharh Al-Kabir [2/430]).

Indeed, the incident and the verses have entered into the jurisprudential deduction for the permissibility of wailing over the dead. Now, the verses are used as evidence, and the poem itself is not inferred!

View Abdul Hosein Al-Amini's work on the issue in *Al-Ghadir* 5/156.

(47) *Al-Kafi* 1/493.

(48) *Tarikh al-Tabari* 2/448.

(49) Al-Sayed Mahdi Al-Khursan states in his book (*Ali Imam Al-Barara*) that the chains of transmission of this Hadith end with three, all of whom were not on line with the Imam, Amir Al-Mu'mineen (s). They are: Abu Hurairah Al-Dawsi, Abdullah bin Al-Zubayr, and Al-Miswar bin Makhramah.

(50) It is as if the issue was a dispute over money or the guardianship of a land and its revenues!

(51) Ibn Katheer Al-Dimashqi: *Al-Bidaya wa'l-Nihaya* 9/487-490.

(52) *Al-Tabari*; *Tarikh al-Tabari* 2/459: "Sa'd bin Ubadah told the Quraishis who pledged allegiance to Abu Bakr in *Al-Saqeefa*, 'If the jinn had gathered together for you with humans, I would not have pledged allegiance to you until I present myself to my Lord and know what my account is!' When Abu Bakr was brought about that, Umar told him, 'Do not leave him until he pledges allegiance!' Bashir bin Sa'd advised, 'He has come and refused, and he is not pledging allegiance to you even if he is killed, and he is not going to be killed until his son, his family, and a group of his clan are killed before him. Leave him, as leaving him will not harm you; he is only one man!' They left him and accepted the advice of Bashir bin Sa'd. Sa'd would not pray as they prayed, nor would he perform Hajj with them...."

(53) View: (*The Great Encyclopedia*) by Al-Sheikh Ismail Al-Ansari Al-Zanjani, (*The Tragedy of Al-Zahra*) by the late Sayed Ja'far Murtada Al-Amili, (*Fatima, from the Cradle to the Grave*) by the late Sayed Muhammad Kadhimi Al-Qazwini, (*The Great Testimony of Al-Zahra*), by Al-Sheikh Ja'far Al-Subhani, (*The Oppression of Al-Zahra*), by Al-Sayed Ali Al-Milani, (*The Attack on the House of Fatima*) by Abdul-Zahra Mahdi, and other books.

(54) He (s) expresses this in the sermon known as *Al- Al-Shiqshiqi*-

yya [foam of a Camel]. Review Nahj al-Balagha.

(55) Al-Tusi, Al-Amali, p.406.

(56) Ibn Abi Al-Hadid in Sharh Nahj Al-Balagha [2/47]: "In Muawiyah's famous letter to Ali, 'The other day you carried the people of your house at night on a donkey, and your hands would be in the hands of your two sons, Al-Hassan and Al-Hussein, on the day Abu Bakr Al-Siddiq was sworn as Caliph. You invited the people of Badr and the predecessors to yourself. You went to them with your wife, brought your sons to them, and sought victory against the companion of the Messenger of Allah..."

In response, the Imam (s) replied - as stated in Al-Ihtijaj 1/272 - in a letter: "You have said that I was dragged like a camel with a nose string to swear allegiance (to Abū Bakr at Saqīfah). By the Eternal Allāh, you had intended to revile me, but you have praised me, and to humiliate me but have yourself been humiliated. What humiliation does it mean for a Muslim to be the victim of oppression so long as he does not entertain any doubt in his religion nor any misgiving in his firm belief! This argument is intended for others, but I have stated it to you only in so far as it was appropriate."

(57) A metaphor meaning to stay away from action.

(58) Al-Tusi, Al-Amali, p.713.

(59) Ibn Abi Al-Hadid in Sharh Nahj Al-Balagha 1/9.

(60) Ibn Shahr Ashub (d. 588 H): Al-Manaqib 2/208.

(61) Al-Tabarsi; Ahmed bin Ali (d. 620 H): Al-Ihtijaj 1/155.

(62) Al-Shami; Yusuf ibn Hatem (d. 664 H): Al-Durr Al-Nazim 465.

(63) Al-Irbili; Ali ibn Isa (d.693): Kashf Al-Ghumma 2/240.

(64) Al-Majlisi: Bihar Al-Anwar 29/372.

(65) Surah Az-Zumar: Verse 65.

(66) Surah Al-Isra: Verses 74 – 75.

(67) Al-Kulayni: Al-Kafi 2/631.

(68) Al- Rouhani; Muhammad-Sadiq: Fadha'il Wa Masa'ib Fatima Zahra 61.

- (69) Al-Asqalani; Ibn Hajar Fath al-Bari 7/14: In a report on the authority of Ubayd Allah bin Umar, "We used to not treat anyone equally with Abu Bakr, then Umar, then Uthman, then we would leave the companions of the Messenger of Allah (p) and do not differentiate between them..."
- (70) Al-Milani; Al-Sayed Ali in (Lectures on Beliefs 2/352) cited Ibn Taymiyya's statements on Imam Ali (s), "He made a mistake in seventeen instances ... [he - meaning Ali] was abandoned wherever he went... he tried to become caliphate repeatedly but could not achieve it.... He fought for rulership, not religion.... He loved being the ruler... Abu Bakr converted to Islam as an old man who knew what he was saying, and Ali converted to Islam as a boy, and conversion to Islam is not valid for a boy... Ali died and did not forget the daughter of Abu Jahil"
- (71) Surah An-Naml: Verse 80.
- (72) Surah Tawbah; Ayah 128.
- (73) Ibn Hamdun: Al-Tazkira Al-Hamduniyya 7/166, and Al-Tabarsi in Al-Ihtijaj.
- (74) Surah Al-Hajj: Verse 39.
- (75) They claimed that Sa'd bin Ubadah was killed by the jinn, and they claim that the jinn said a poem about the event which they cite. Because the matter is like a joke, Mumin Al-Taq (Abdullah bin Jundub), who was among those who debated the Imamate and its affairs, said to a questioner who asked him, "What prevented Ali from quarreling with Abu Bakr over the caliphate?" He said, "O my nephew, he is afraid that the jinn will kill him!!" This was also reported by Ibn Abi Al-Hadid in Sharh Nahj Al-Balagha 17/223. Ibn Abi Al-Hadid commented on it by saying, "As for me, I do not believe that the jinn killed Sa'd, nor that this is the poetry of the jinn. I do not doubt that humans killed him and that this poetry is the poetry of humans..."
- (76) Surah At-Tawbah Verse 61
- (77) Al-Hilali; Sulaym ibn Qais: The book of Sulaym ibn Qais 2/38: "Ali (s) jumped up and grabbed Umar by the collar while pulling him by force. He then threw him on the floor and hit him on the nose and neck, wanting to kill him. However, He (s) remembered

the order of the Messenger of Allah (s) and his will and said: 'O son of Sahlak! I swear by the one who gave Muhammad (s) high stature by assigning him as a Prophet if it was not because of what Allah had destined and the covenant between the Prophet (s) and me, you would have known that you couldn't enter my house!'"

(78) Al-Saduq; Muhammad bin Ali bin Babawayh: Illal al-Shara'i' 1/47.

(79) Al-Saduq: Al-Tawhid 289.

(80) Surah Al-Mu'minun: verse 24.

(81) Even more shocking than the act itself is its justification and excuse! It is stated in one of their answers to the question, "In Sahih al-Bukhari, Muslim, Al-Tirmidhi, and other books of authentic Hadiths, why don't we find Hadiths on the authority of Fatima the daughter of the Messenger except for one? They replied, "The reason for the low number of Hadiths of Fatima (r) is that she did not live long after the death of the Prophet (p). She could not narrate what she heard from the Prophet (p) like other long-lived companions?"

We ask the respondent: Was it necessary for the Prophet to die for Fatima to narrate from him? Why didn't she report while he was alive? Why didn't women take from her what her father taught her?

<https://www.islamweb.net>fatwa>

(82) Al-Zylaei; Jamal Al-Din (d. 762) Takhrij Hadiths Al-Kashshaf 4/67. He said, "It is reported by Abu Nu'aym in Al-Hilyah, and with this chain of transmission and the text, Al-Tha'labi narrated it in his interpretation, and Ibn Hibban narrated it in his Sahih and Al-Hakim in his Mustadrak from the Hadith of Ibn Abbas. He said, 'The Messenger of Allah (p) said, 'The best women in the world are four..."

So, he mentions the four women, and Al-Hakim authenticates the Hadith. The rest also narrated it except Muslim, Al-Tirmidhi and Ibn Majah in Al-Atima, and Al-Nasa'i in Al-Manaqib.

The Hadith was narrated by Al-Bukhari in his Sahih. There is no mention of Khadija or Fatima in it. He states, "Allah's Mes-

senger (p) said, 'Many amongst men attained perfection, but amongst women, none attained the perfection except Mary, the daughter of `Imran and Asiya, the wife of Pharaoh. And the superiority of `Aisha to other women is like the superiority of Tharid (i.e., an Arabic dish) to other meals.'

(83) Surah Ash-Shu'ara: Verse 214.

(84) Al-Tabari, Abu Ja'far (d. 310) Tafsir Al-Tabari 17/654. We have to ask Al-Tabari, the transmitter, how the Prophet said to Fatima, "I do not own anything for you from God," with the fact that her birth was about five years after the beginning of the prophecy (according to the opinion of the Imamis, which was mentioned previously)? The "Verses of Warning" and Hadiths on the topic were at the beginning of the prophecy, so how does he address her to save herself from the fire when she has not been born yet? Indeed, even if we believe what the historians of the Caliphs School said, that she was born five years before the prophecy, she would be six when the verses were revealed.

(85) Ibn Hanbal; Ahmad (d. 241) Musnad Ahmad 11/137.

(86) Al-Sunan Al-Saghir by Al-Bayhaqi 3/320 - Abu Bakr Al-Bayhaqi (d. 458).

(87) Al-Tabarani; Abu Al-Qasim (d. 360) Al-Mu'jam Al-Kabir 1/108, Mu'jam Abu Ya'la Al-Mawsili (d. 307) 1/190, and Al-Hakim Al-Naysaburi, in Al-Mustadrak 3/154, said, "This hadith has an authentic chain of narration, but they did not narrate it."

(88) (Ibn Taymiyya (728 H) says in his book Minhaj al-Sunnah 4/249, commenting on it, "This is a lie on his part (Al-Allama Al-Hilli)! They did not narrate this on the authority of the Prophet (p). This is not known in any of the known books of Hadith, nor does it have a known chain of transmission on the authority of the Prophet (p), neither Sahih nor Hasan"

As for Shams Al-Din Al-Dhahabi (d. 748), he said, after quoting Al-Nayshaburi's remarks that it was an authentic hadith, "I (Al-Dhahabi) say: rather it is not authentic, and Hussein is weak."

(89) View Minhaj Al-Sunnah 4/250.

(90) Al-San'ani (d. 1182): Al-Tanwir Sharh Al-Jami' Al-Saghir 3/277.

The Hadith has been transmitted - in multiple ways - by scholars of Hadith. Nour al-Din al-Haythami (d. 807) comments on it in *Majma' al-Zawa'id* and *Manba' al-Fawa'id* 9/204, "It was narrated by Al-Tabarani, and its men are trustworthy." Al-Hakim mentioned it in *Al-Mustadrak* 2/181 after deleting what contradicted the views of their school of thought, "This is an authentic hadith according to the conditions of the two Sheikhs, and they did not narrate it."

Perhaps you know, dear reader, why they did not narrate it!

(91) We remind you to return to the matter of her marriage, in which we said that they forgot here what they said there, that her birth was five years before the prophecy! Therefore, according to them, she was about 19 years old in that situation! How can she be young? Did the Prophet not know the age of his daughter? How did he allow himself to marry Aisha, who was nine years old, as they say, and did not accept the marriage of his daughter because of her young age?

(92) *Al-Mawdu'at* by Ibn al-Jawzi (d.1201) 1/418.

(93) Al-Dhahabi, *Shams Al-Din: Talkhees Al-Mawdu'at* 1/148. Likewise, it was weakened by Al-Albani in *Da'eef al-Jami* (1566) and *Al-Silsilah Al-Da'eefah* (1549).

We do not see anything wrong with it except that it contradicts their creed. Why would the Prophet reject them when he is the one who said, "When someone with whose religion and character you are satisfied asks your daughter in marriage, accede to his request. If you do not do so, there will be temptation in the earth and extensive corruption." The matter is that this marriage is from divine order and a heavenly command!

